

# Summary Contents

	Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access . . . . .	iii
	NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law . . . . .	iv
	Contents . . . . .	ix
Chapter 1	Introduction and Practice Checklists . . . . .	1
Chapter 2	Investigatory Techniques . . . . .	17
Chapter 3	Automobile Title Law . . . . .	79
Chapter 4	Yo-Yo (Spot-Delivery) Abuses and Sublease Scams . . . . .	101
Chapter 5	Federal and State Odometer Requirements . . . . .	129
Chapter 6	Remedies for MVICSA and State Odometer Act Violations . . . . .	165
Chapter 7	Other Statutes Specifically Relating to Automobile Fraud . . . . .	183
Chapter 8	Common Law Fraud, Deceit, and Misrepresentation . . . . .	215
Chapter 9	Warranty, Mistake, UDAP, RICO, Unconscionability, Negligence, and Contract Claims . . . . .	297
Chapter 10	Litigating Automobile Fraud Cases . . . . .	351
Appendix A	Federal Statutes . . . . .	449
Appendix B	Federal Regulations . . . . .	461
Appendix C	State Laws Relating to Automobile Fraud . . . . .	495
Appendix D	State Statutes and Regulations Relating to Yo-Yo Sales . . . . .	535

Appendix E	State-by-State Information on Requesting Title Histories . . . . .	541
Appendix F	State Automobile Dealer Licensing Offices . . . . .	549
Appendix G	Sample Pleadings Available Online . . . . .	555
Appendix H	Websites Related to Automobile Fraud . . . . .	559
	Index . . . . .	561

# Contents

Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access . . . . .	iii
--	-----

NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law . . . . .	iv
---	----

## Chapter 1

### Introduction and Practice Checklists

1.1 About This Treatise . . . . .	1
1.1.1 Nature of Automobile Fraud . . . . .	1
1.1.2 About This Treatise . . . . .	1
1.1.2.1 All Subscribers Have Access to the Digital Version . . . . .	1
1.1.2.2 Structure of the Chapters . . . . .	2
1.1.2.3 The Appendices and Indexes . . . . .	2
1.1.2.4 Additional Pleadings, Primary Sources, and Practice Tools . . . . .	2
1.1.2.5 Clearinghouse and Other Unreported Cases . . . . .	3
1.2 Types of Automobile Frauds Addressed in This Treatise . . . . .	3
1.2.1 Introduction . . . . .	3
1.2.2 Odometer Fraud . . . . .	3
1.2.3 Salvage Fraud . . . . .	4
1.2.4 Undisclosed Flood or Hurricane Damage . . . . .	4
1.2.5 Other Undisclosed Wreck Damage to Used Cars . . . . .	5
1.2.6 Undisclosed Damage to New Cars . . . . .	6
1.2.7 Lemon Laundering . . . . .	6
1.2.8 Other Failures to Disclose Preexisting Mechanical Problems . . . . .	7
1.2.9 Misrepresentations Concerning Demonstrators, Program Cars, and Other Low-Mileage Vehicles . . . . .	7
1.2.10 Misrepresentation of Number or Nature of Prior Users . . . . .	8
1.2.11 Stolen Vehicles and Defective Title . . . . .	8
1.2.12 Gray Market Vehicles . . . . .	9
1.2.13 Used Cars Sold with Missing Airbags . . . . .	9
1.2.14 Yo-Yo Transactions . . . . .	9
1.2.15 Sublease Scams . . . . .	10
1.3 Automobile Frauds Analyzed in Other NCLC Treatises . . . . .	10
1.3.1 Introduction . . . . .	10
1.3.2 Automobile Warranties and Repairs . . . . .	10
1.3.3 Deceptive Pricing and Sales Techniques . . . . .	10
1.3.4 Trade-Ins, Yo-Yo Sales, and Financing . . . . .	10
1.3.5 Credit Insurance, GAP Insurance, and Service Contracts . . . . .	11
1.3.6 Documentary Fees, Other Charges, Add-Ons and Options . . . . .	11
1.3.7 Leasing . . . . .	11
1.3.8 Repossessions and Collection Activity . . . . .	12
1.3.9 Force-Placed Automobile Insurance . . . . .	12
1.3.10 Credit Reports . . . . .	12
1.3.11 Discrimination . . . . .	12
1.4 Automobile Litigation Checklist . . . . .	12
1.4.1 Introduction . . . . .	12

1.4.2	Legal Claims . . . . .	12
1.4.2.1	Dealer Sales Tactics . . . . .	12
1.4.2.2	Financing, Add-Ons, and Insurance . . . . .	13
1.4.2.3	Used Car Sales Abuses . . . . .	13
1.4.2.4	New Car Sales Abuses . . . . .	14
1.4.2.5	Vehicle Defects . . . . .	14
1.4.2.6	Repossessions . . . . .	14
1.4.2.7	Leasing Sales, Defects, and Termination . . . . .	15
1.4.2.8	Auto Title Pawn Loans . . . . .	15
1.4.2.9	Other . . . . .	15
1.4.3	Investigation and Litigation . . . . .	15
1.4.3.1	Investigation Techniques and Discovery . . . . .	15
1.4.3.2	Litigation Issues . . . . .	16

Chapter 2

Investigatory Techniques

2.1	Automobile Frauds Described . . . . .	17
2.1.1	Introduction . . . . .	17
2.1.2	Odometer Fraud . . . . .	17
2.1.2.1	Extent and History . . . . .	17
2.1.2.2	What Is an Odometer? . . . . .	18
2.1.2.3	Rollbacks and Disconnects . . . . .	19
2.1.2.4	Collusion by Subsequent Buyers . . . . .	20
2.1.2.5	More Subtle Forms of Odometer Fraud . . . . .	20
2.1.2.6	Most Common Forms of Odometer Fraud Today . . . . .	20
2.1.3	Undisclosed Flood Damage . . . . .	20
2.1.4	Undisclosed Prior Wreck Damage . . . . .	20
2.1.5	Hurricane Damage . . . . .	22
2.1.6	Undisclosed Prior History of Mechanical Problems and Lemon Laundering . . . . .	22
2.1.7	Misrepresentations About Prior Owners or Prior Use . . . . .	23
2.1.8	Undisclosed History As Stolen Car . . . . .	24
2.1.9	Undisclosed Damage to New Cars . . . . .	24
2.1.10	Undisclosed Canadian or Other Foreign Origin . . . . .	24
2.1.10.1	Introduction . . . . .	24
2.1.10.2	Odometer Discrepancies in Canadian Vehicles . . . . .	24
2.1.10.3	Warranty and Other Problems . . . . .	25
2.1.10.4	Identifying a Vehicle As Not Manufactured for the United States Market . . . . .	25
2.2	Investigating Fraud Based on Information Within the Consumer's Control . . . . .	26
2.2.1	Interview with the Consumer . . . . .	26
2.2.2	Stickers and Paperwork Found on and in the Car . . . . .	26
2.2.3	The Car's Tires . . . . .	27
2.2.4	The Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) . . . . .	27
2.2.4.1	Use of VINs in Automobile Fraud Investigations . . . . .	27
2.2.4.2	How to Check a VIN . . . . .	28
2.2.5	Cursory Physical Inspection of the Car . . . . .	29
2.2.6	A Haywire Odometer . . . . .	30
2.2.7	Checking the Odometer History with a Franchised Dealer . . . . .	30
2.2.8	Checking a Motor Home's Engine Hour Meter . . . . .	30
2.2.9	Expert Inspection of the Vehicle . . . . .	30
2.2.9.1	Finding an Expert . . . . .	30
2.2.9.2	What the Expert Should Check . . . . .	31

2.2.9.3	Inspection Procedures and Techniques . . . . .	32
2.2.9.4	Defense Inspections . . . . .	32
2.2.10	Looking at the Consumer’s Documents. . . . .	33
2.2.10.1	The New Title . . . . .	33
2.2.10.2	Other Documents Relating to Title . . . . .	33
2.2.10.3	Repair Documents. . . . .	33
2.2.11	Used Car Pricing Guides . . . . .	34
2.2.12	Advertisements . . . . .	34
2.3	Summary Title History . . . . .	34
2.3.1	When and When Not to Use Summary Title Reports . . . . .	34
2.3.2	Carfax . . . . .	35
2.3.3	AutoCheck . . . . .	37
2.3.4	The National Motor Vehicle Title Information System . . . . .	37
2.3.5	Information Sources for Canadian Vehicles . . . . .	38
2.3.6	Insurance Databases. . . . .	38
2.3.7	Other Quick Search Procedures. . . . .	39
2.4	Detailed Title Histories . . . . .	39
2.4.1	Introduction . . . . .	39
2.4.2	How a Chain of Title Works . . . . .	39
2.4.2.1	General . . . . .	39
2.4.2.2	Information Found on the Title. . . . .	40
2.4.2.3	Powers of Attorney, Registrations, Title Applications, and Other Information Available Through a Title Search. . . . .	41
2.4.2.4	How the DMV Stores Title Information. . . . .	41
2.4.3	Electronic Titling . . . . .	42
2.4.4	How to Obtain Detailed Title Histories . . . . .	43
2.4.5	How to Use Title Information to Uncover Fraud. . . . .	44
2.4.5.1	Reviewing the Consumer’s Own Signature on the Old Title . . . . .	44
2.4.5.2	Names and Addresses of Prior Owners. . . . .	44
2.4.5.3	Odometer Discrepancies. . . . .	44
2.4.5.4	Flood-Damaged, Wrecked, Rebuilt, and Other Salvage Vehicles . . . . .	45
2.4.5.4.1	General . . . . .	45
2.4.5.4.2	Understanding salvage brands . . . . .	45
2.4.5.4.3	When salvage brand still on the new title . . . . .	46
2.4.5.4.4	When salvage brand is removed from title. . . . .	46
2.4.5.4.5	When insurance company or body shop is a transferor, but no title brand was applied for . . . . .	47
2.4.5.4.6	When insurance company or body shop is not listed in salvage vehicle’s chain of title . . . . .	47
2.4.5.5	Lemon Laundering . . . . .	47
2.4.5.6	Number of Prior Owners; Demonstrators; Lease or Rental Cars, Taxis, Police Cars, and Other Unusual Prior Owners . . . . .	48
2.4.5.7	Duplicate Titles; Laundered Titles; Powers of Attorney. . . . .	48
2.4.5.8	Suspicious Mileage on a Fleet Vehicle . . . . .	49
2.5	Obtaining Information from Others Involved in Car’s History. . . . .	49
2.5.1	Contacting the Prior Consumer Owners . . . . .	49
2.5.2	Automobile Dealers. . . . .	50
2.5.2.1	Records Dealers Are Required to Keep . . . . .	50
2.5.2.2	Other Dealer Records . . . . .	50

2.5.2.2.1	Introduction	50
2.5.2.2.2	Deal files and file jackets	50
2.5.2.2.3	The worksheet, purchase order, and retail installment sales contract	50
2.5.2.2.4	Recap sheets and charge backs.	51
2.5.2.2.5	Finance facsimiles, finance reserves, credit application, and business manager's summary	51
2.5.2.2.6	Log books, cash draw files, and business manager's penetration and performance reports.	52
2.5.2.2.7	Payroll records, policy and procedure manuals, training manuals, and advertising.	53
2.5.2.2.8	Dealer contracts with third parties; association files	53
2.5.2.2.9	Repair records	53
2.5.2.3	Present Dealer Employees	54
2.5.2.4	Former Dealer Employees	54
2.5.2.5	Speaking the Dealer's Language on Odometer Rollbacks	54
2.5.2.6	Contacting the Selling Dealer and Prior Servicing Dealers Concerning Mechanical Problems	55
2.5.2.7	When New Car Damaged Before Delivery	55
2.5.3	Wholesalers and the Vehicle's Other Dealer Transferors	55
2.5.4	Auctions.	56
2.5.5	Secured Creditors.	56
2.5.6	Floor Plan Financers	57
2.5.7	Lessors and Lessees.	58
2.5.8	Rental Car Companies.	58
2.5.9	Insurance Companies and Body Shops	58
2.5.10	Manufacturers	59
2.5.11	Service Contract Companies	60
2.5.12	Information About Whether the Dealer Obtained a Vehicle History Report	60
2.5.13	Absence of Information from Vehicle History Report.	60
2.5.14	Records of Insurance Claims.	60
2.5.15	Information Available from Government Agencies.	60
2.5.16	Trade Associations.	62
2.5.17	Online Resources.	62
2.6	Uncovering a Party's Special Culpability	63
2.6.1	Introduction	63
2.6.2	The Culpability of the Selling Dealer	64
2.6.2.1	General	64
2.6.2.2	Title Documents Known to the Dealer	64
2.6.2.3	The Car's Physical Appearance	65
2.6.2.4	Dealer's Inspection or Duty to Inspect Car.	65
2.6.2.5	Price Paid by Dealer	66
2.6.2.6	Dealer Knowledge of Carfax Report; Other Title Searches	66
2.6.2.7	Wholesaler or Other Seller's Reputation	66
2.6.2.8	A Pattern of Misconduct	67
2.6.2.9	Warnings from Dealer Associations or State Regulators	67
2.6.2.10	Dealer Knowledge of Service and Warranty History	67

2.6.2.11	When Dealer Informed Service Contract or Warranty Is Void . . . . .	67
2.6.2.12	Access to Computer Read-Out of True Mileage . . . . .	68
2.6.3	Wholesalers and Other Dealers Transferring the Car to Dealers . . . . .	68
2.6.4	Automobile Auctions . . . . .	69
2.6.4.1	Dealer-Only Automobile Auctions Described . . . . .	69
2.6.4.2	Salvage Auctions . . . . .	70
2.6.4.3	Public Auctions . . . . .	70
2.6.4.4	Auction Culpability for Car Fraud . . . . .	70
2.6.5	Insurance Companies . . . . .	72
2.6.6	Manufacturers . . . . .	73
2.6.7	Secured Creditors in the Chain of Title . . . . .	74
2.6.8	Creditor Financing the Sale to the Consumer . . . . .	74
2.6.9	Prior Private Owners . . . . .	74
2.7	A Special Case: Cloned and Retagged Vehicles . . . . .	75
2.7.1	Introduction . . . . .	75
2.7.2	Falsifying the VIN . . . . .	76
2.7.3	Falsifying the Title . . . . .	76
2.7.4	Investigatory Techniques . . . . .	77
2.7.4.1	Examining the VIN on the Vehicle . . . . .	77
2.7.4.2	Checking Title History and Other Paperwork . . . . .	77
2.8	Another Special Case: Used Cars Sold Without Airbags . . . . .	78

## Chapter 3

### Automobile Title Law

3.1	What Every Consumer Lawyer Needs to Know About Automobile Titles . . . . .	79
3.2	How Automobile Titles Work . . . . .	79
3.2.1	Introduction . . . . .	79
3.2.2	Titling a New Vehicle . . . . .	79
3.2.3	Obtaining a New Title After Purchasing for Use . . . . .	80
3.2.4	Title Transfers to Dealers and Others Purchasing for Resale . . . . .	80
3.2.5	Transfers Not Requiring Assignment of Title . . . . .	81
3.2.6	Applicability of Federal Exemption for Certain Vehicles . . . . .	81
3.2.7	Vehicle Registration and License Plates . . . . .	81
3.3	Transferee Must Sign Title Documents . . . . .	81
3.3.1	Importance of the Issue . . . . .	81
3.3.2	Consumer's Signature When New Vehicle Is Transferred . . . . .	82
3.3.3	Standard Procedure When Used Vehicle Is Transferred . . . . .	82
3.3.4	When Transferee Signature Allowed to Be on Reassignment Form Instead of on Title . . . . .	83
3.3.5	When Transferee Signature Allowed to Be on Power of Attorney Instead of on Title . . . . .	84
3.3.5.1	General . . . . .	84
3.3.5.2	Form of a Valid Power of Attorney . . . . .	84
3.3.5.3	State Law Must Allow Use of Power of Attorney . . . . .	84
3.3.5.4	Consumer Must Consent to Use of Power of Attorney . . . . .	84
3.3.5.5	Part A of the Power of Attorney Must Already Be Completed . . . . .	84
3.3.5.6	Use of Part A Allowed in Only Two Situations . . . . .	85
3.3.5.7	Further Requirements for a Valid Power of Attorney . . . . .	85
3.3.6	Fallacious Argument That Buyer Cannot Legally Review All Information on the Title . . . . .	86
3.4	Information That Must Be Provided to Transferee on Title Document . . . . .	86
3.4.1	Risk of Forgery and Alterations . . . . .	86

3.4.2	Information on the Title Document . . . . .	86
3.4.3	Title Brands and Salvage Titles . . . . .	87
3.4.4	Duplicate Titles . . . . .	87
3.5	Title Information That Dealers Must Retain . . . . .	87
3.6	How Soon Must Transfer Be Completed on Title Documents? . . . . .	88
3.6.1	Introduction . . . . .	88
3.6.2	Federal Requirements . . . . .	88
3.6.3	Explicit State Requirements As to Timing . . . . .	88
3.6.4	No Ownership Change Until Title Documents Transferred . . . . .	89
3.6.5	Requirement That Dealer Possess the Title at the Time of Sale . . . . .	89
3.6.6	Timing Requirements for Temporary Tags and Registrations . . . . .	89
3.7	Electronic Liens and Titling . . . . .	90
3.8	Privacy of Title Information . . . . .	92
3.8.1	The Driver’s Privacy Protection Act . . . . .	92
3.8.2	DPPA Allows DMV to Release Names and Addresses in Selected Circumstances . . . . .	92
3.8.3	DPPA Requires DMV to Release Data When Safety Is at Stake . . . . .	94
3.8.4	Data from Sources Other Than DMV . . . . .	94
3.8.5	Constitutional Challenges . . . . .	94
3.8.6	State Restrictions on Release of Identity of Former Owners . . . . .	94
3.9	Remedies for Title Violations . . . . .	95
3.9.1	Scope of This Section . . . . .	95
3.9.2	MVICSA Remedies . . . . .	95
3.9.2.1	Utility of a MVICSA Claim . . . . .	95
3.9.2.2	Must “Intent to Defraud” Relate to Odometer Violation? . . . . .	95
3.9.2.3	Older Case Law No Longer Applicable . . . . .	96
3.9.2.4	Situations in Which a MVICSA Claim May Be Available . . . . .	96
3.9.2.5	When Court Finds Intent Must Relate to Mileage Requirements . . . . .	97
3.9.3	Remedies Under the State Motor Vehicle Title Statute . . . . .	97
3.9.4	MVICSA and State Motor Vehicle Title Statute Violations As UDAP Violations . . . . .	98
3.9.5	Common Law Claims and Title Violations . . . . .	98
3.9.6	Securities Fraud . . . . .	99

## Chapter 4

### Yo-Yo (Spot-Delivery) Abuses and Sublease Scams

4.1	Getting Started . . . . .	101
4.1.1	Introduction . . . . .	101
4.1.2	Yo-Yo Transactions Explained . . . . .	101
4.1.3	Organization of This Chapter . . . . .	102
4.1.4	State Yo-Yo Laws . . . . .	103
4.2	Dealer’s Right to Cancel the Yo-Yo Transaction . . . . .	103
4.2.1	Absent Valid Contingency Clause, No Right to Cancel . . . . .	103
4.2.2	Contingency Must Be in Writing . . . . .	104
4.2.3	Cancellation Allegedly Based on Credit Application Misstatements . . . . .	104
4.2.4	Absence of Dealer Signature Does Not Create a Valid Contingency . . . . .	104
4.2.5	Does Contingency Clause Comply with State Law? . . . . .	105
4.2.6	When Contingency Placed in a Separate Document or Conflicts with Other Financing Terms . . . . .	105
4.2.7	Have the Exact Conditions Allowing Cancellation Occurred? . . . . .	106
4.2.8	When Dealer Knows in Advance That the Contingency Will Not Be Met . . . . .	107
4.2.9	Misrepresentations That the Sale Is Final . . . . .	107



4.2.10 UDAP and Other Consumer Remedies When Cancellation Not Valid . . . . .	108
4.3 Federal Disclosure and Notice Requirements . . . . .	109
4.3.1 Introduction . . . . .	109
4.3.2 The Truth in Lending Disclosure Form . . . . .	109
4.3.3 ECOA and FCRA Notice Requirements . . . . .	111
4.3.3.1 General . . . . .	111
4.3.3.2 Is the Dealer a Covered Creditor Under the ECOA? . . . . .	112
4.3.3.3 The Counteroffer Defense . . . . .	113
4.3.3.4 Other Dealer Defenses . . . . .	113
4.3.3.5 ECOA Remedies . . . . .	113
4.4 Dealers Almost Always Improperly Structure the Yo-Yo Transaction . . . . .	113
4.4.1 Dealers Improperly Mix and Match Two Different Types of Transactions. . . . .	113
4.4.2 Is the Sale an Illegal Condition Precedent or an Illegal Condition Subsequent Yo-Yo Transaction? . . . . .	114
4.4.3 Dealer Practices Inconsistent with a Condition Precedent Transaction . . . . .	115
4.4.3.1 Introduction. . . . .	115
4.4.3.2 Earning Interest Before the Financing Is Extended . . . . .	115
4.4.3.3 TILA Disclosure of Loan Term and APR. . . . .	115
4.4.3.4 Service Contract’s Term and Excessive Finance Charges Relating to That Contract . . . . .	115
4.4.3.5 Excess Insurance Premiums and Related Finance Charges . . . . .	115
4.4.3.6 Improper Treatment of the Consumer’s Trade-In . . . . .	116
4.4.3.7 Improper Use of Temporary Tags . . . . .	116
4.4.3.8 Improper Use of Dealer Plates . . . . .	116
4.4.3.9 Dealer Misrepresentation As to Consumer’s Cancellation Rights . . . . .	116
4.4.4 Dealer Practices Inconsistent with a Condition Subsequent Transaction. . . . .	116
4.4.4.1 Titling Practices . . . . .	116
4.4.4.2 Repossession Titles When Dealer Transferred Title . . . . .	118
4.4.4.3 Condition Subsequent Sales Must Comply with UCC Article 9 . . . . .	118
4.4.4.4 Truth in Lending Violations in a Condition Subsequent Sale . . . . .	119
4.5 Illegal Practices Accompanying a Cancellation . . . . .	119
4.5.1 Refusing to Return Trade-Ins and Deposits. . . . .	119
4.5.2 Malicious Prosecution When Consumer Does Not Return the Vehicle . . . . .	122
4.6 Misrepresentations Involving a Second Transaction . . . . .	122
4.6.1 Renegotiation Misrepresentations . . . . .	122
4.6.2 Backdating Documentation of a Subsequent Sale . . . . .	123
4.7 Yo-Yo Litigation . . . . .	123
4.7.1 Must the Consumer Arbitrate Yo-Yo Sale Claims? . . . . .	123
4.7.2 Discovery in Yo-Yo Sale Cases . . . . .	124
4.7.3 Consumer Recoveries . . . . .	125
4.8 Automobile Subleases . . . . .	125
4.8.1 Described . . . . .	125
4.8.2 Consumer Remedies . . . . .	126

Chapter 5

Federal and State Odometer Requirements

5.1 First Matters . . . . .	129
5.1.1 Scope of This Chapter . . . . .	129

5.1.2	Overview of the Federal Act . . . . .	129
5.1.3	1994 Recodification Did Not Change the Act’s Substance . . . . .	129
5.1.4	NHTSA Interpretations of the Act . . . . .	130
5.1.5	State Odometer Acts and Their Relationship to the Federal Act . . . . .	130
5.2	Scope of the Federal Act . . . . .	131
5.2.1	Persons Who Must Comply with the Federal Act . . . . .	131
5.2.2	Covered Motor Vehicles . . . . .	131
5.2.3	What Is an Odometer? . . . . .	131
5.3	Restrictions on Odometer Tampering . . . . .	132
5.3.1	Disconnecting, Resetting, or Altering Odometers . . . . .	132
5.3.2	Operating a Motor Vehicle with Knowledge the Odometer Is Disconnected or Nonfunctional . . . . .	133
5.3.3	Selling of Unlawful Odometer Devices . . . . .	133
5.4	Repair or Replacement of an Odometer . . . . .	134
5.5	False Statements Made Outside the Disclosure Form . . . . .	135
5.6	Disclosure Requirements . . . . .	135
5.6.1	Introduction . . . . .	135
5.6.2	Parties Responsible for Making Disclosures . . . . .	136
5.6.2.1	In General . . . . .	136
5.6.2.2	Transferor and transferee . . . . .	136
5.6.2.3	Lessees . . . . .	137
5.6.3	Transfers for Which Disclosures Must Be Made . . . . .	137
5.6.3.1	Transfers Broadly Defined . . . . .	137
5.6.3.2	Repossessions, Transfers to Insurers, and Other Involuntary Transfers . . . . .	138
5.6.3.3	When Vehicle Sold at Auction . . . . .	138
5.6.3.4	Transfer of Component Parts . . . . .	139
5.6.3.5	Exclusion for Transfers of New Cars to Rental Car Companies . . . . .	139
5.6.4	Transfers NHTSA Exempts from Disclosure Requirements . . . . .	139
5.6.4.1	General . . . . .	139
5.6.4.2	Relation of NHTSA Exemptions to State Law . . . . .	140
5.6.4.3	Can the Transferor Waive the Exemption? . . . . .	140
5.6.4.4	Exemption for Vehicles over Ten Years Old . . . . .	140
5.6.4.5	Exemption for Transfers of New Cars to Dealers . . . . .	141
5.6.4.6	Exemptions for Heavy Trucks and Motor Homes, Trailers, Manufactured Homes, and Government Vehicles . . . . .	141
5.6.5	Method of Making Disclosures . . . . .	141
5.6.5.1	Introduction . . . . .	141
5.6.5.2	Disclosure Procedure for New Cars . . . . .	142
5.6.5.3	Used Car Transfers Typically Make Odometer Disclosures on the Old Title . . . . .	142
5.6.5.4	Use of Additional Disclosure Form in Transfer of Used Vehicle . . . . .	143
5.6.5.5	Dealer to Dealer Transfers and the Use of Reassignment Forms . . . . .	143
5.6.5.6	Disclosures When Old Title Unavailable— Use of Power of Attorney . . . . .	144
5.6.5.6.1	When powers of attorney are allowed . . . . .	144
5.6.5.6.2	Requirements for “first” powers of attorney . . . . .	145
5.6.5.6.3	Requirements for “second” powers of attorney . . . . .	146

5.6.5.6.4	Subsequent purchaser’s access to first power of attorney . . . . .	147
5.6.5.7	Alternative State Disclosure Systems for Electronic Titles . . . . .	147
5.6.6	Content of Mileage Disclosures . . . . .	148
5.6.6.1	General . . . . .	148
5.6.6.2	Disclosure When Odometer Has “Turned Over” . . . . .	148
5.6.6.3	Disclosure of Odometer’s Reading When Transferor Indicates That Reading Is Inaccurate . . . . .	149
5.6.6.4	Dealer Must Have Sufficient Basis to Claim That Odometer Is <i>Not</i> Accurate. . . . .	150
5.6.6.5	When Lessor Transfers Ownership Without First Recovering Possession from the Lessee . . . . .	150
5.6.6.6	Cars Sold for Salvage . . . . .	151
5.6.6.7	When a Used Vehicle Is Assembled from Parts or Restored . . . . .	152
5.6.6.8	When a Repair Shop Resets the Odometer. . . . .	152
5.6.6.9	When Vehicles Have Been Towed . . . . .	152
5.6.6.10	When Odometer Formerly Measured Kilometers Instead of Miles . . . . .	153
5.6.7	Non-Mileage Disclosures . . . . .	153
5.6.7.1	Content of Non-Mileage Disclosures . . . . .	153
5.6.7.2	Signature Requirements . . . . .	154
5.6.7.3	NHTSA Authority to Require Non-Mileage Disclosures . . . . .	154
5.6.8	Acceptance of Incomplete Disclosures . . . . .	155
5.6.9	Record Retention Requirements for Dealers, Distributors, Auction Companies, and Lessors . . . . .	155
5.7	Conspiracy . . . . .	155
5.8	The Intent Requirement . . . . .	156
5.8.1	When Intent Must Be Shown Under the Federal Act . . . . .	156
5.8.2	Need Intent Be Proven Under State Odometer Statutes? . . . . .	156
5.8.3	General Standards Concerning Proof of Intent . . . . .	157
5.8.4	Inferring Intent from Proof of Odometer Tampering. . . . .	158
5.8.5	Inferring Intent When Disclosure Conflicts with Prior Disclosures . . . . .	159
5.8.6	Inferring Intent from Failure to Disclose or from Dealer’s Circumvention of Disclosure Requirement . . . . .	159
5.8.7	Inferring Intent When Inaccurate Disclosure Made Based on Incomplete Prior Disclosure . . . . .	160
5.8.8	Inferring Intent from Dealer’s Failure to Investigate. . . . .	160
5.8.9	Inferring Intent from a Carfax Report . . . . .	162
5.8.10	Does a Repossessing Creditor’s Lack of Investigation Show Intent? . . . . .	162
5.8.11	When There Is a Pattern of “Clerical Errors” . . . . .	162
5.8.12	Did the Dealer Attempt to Correct the Error? . . . . .	162
5.8.13	Reliance on Invalid NHTSA Advice Makes Proof of Intent Difficult . . . . .	163
5.8.14	Examples of Dealers Overcoming Presumption of Intent . . . . .	163
5.8.15	Courts Are Less Likely to Infer a Consumer’s Intent to Defraud . . . . .	163
5.9	Consumer’s Waiver of Rights Under the Act. . . . .	164

## Chapter 6

### Remedies for MVICSA and State Odometer Act Violations

6.1	Introduction . . . . .	165
6.2	Standing in Private Actions; No Privity Required . . . . .	165
6.2.1	Federal Act Does Not Restrict Standing . . . . .	165
6.2.2	Transferee Can Sue Prior Transferors; No Privity Required . . . . .	166
6.2.3	Plaintiff Need Not Be Current Title Owner . . . . .	166

6.2.4	Parties Indirectly Affected by Odometer Violation . . . . .	166
6.2.5	Lessor and Lessee Suits Against Each Other. . . . .	167
6.2.6	Can Wrongdoer Sue Its Transferee or Transferor Under the Act? . . . . .	167
6.3	Do All Disclosure Violations Lead to a Private Right of Action? . . . . .	167
6.4	Statute of Limitations . . . . .	167
6.4.1	The Two-Year Rule Under the Federal Act . . . . .	167
6.4.2	Statute of Limitations Under State Odometer Acts . . . . .	168
6.4.3	Use of Counterclaim or Recoupment When Statute of Limitations Has Run . . . . .	169
6.5	Jurisdiction, Venue, and Right to Jury Trial Under the Federal Act . . . . .	169
6.5.1	Federal Court Jurisdiction . . . . .	169
6.5.2	Venue . . . . .	169
6.5.3	Right to Jury Trial . . . . .	169
6.6	Choosing Between State and Federal Claims and Courts . . . . .	169
6.6.1	Claim Selection Largely Determines Court Selection. . . . .	169
6.6.2	Factors in Choosing Between State and Federal Claims and Courts. . . . .	170
6.6.3	Benefits of Adding a State Odometer Claim to a Federal Act Claim . . . . .	171
6.7	Drafting the Complaint . . . . .	171
6.8	Private Remedies . . . . .	172
6.8.1	Treble Damages . . . . .	172
6.8.1.1	General . . . . .	172
6.8.1.2	Diminished Value of the Vehicle. . . . .	172
6.8.1.3	Computing Diminished Value When True Mileage Cannot Be Determined . . . . .	174
6.8.1.4	Availability of Treble Damages When Consumer Seeks to Rescind the Transaction . . . . .	174
6.8.1.5	Cost of Service Contracts, Other Voided Coverages . . . . .	175
6.8.1.6	Costs to Determine Odometer Discrepancy . . . . .	175
6.8.1.7	Repair Costs and Substitute Transportation Expenses . . . . .	175
6.8.1.8	Financing Costs and Other Charges That Are Higher Than Warranted Because of Vehicle's Diminished Value. . . . .	176
6.8.1.9	Other Consequential Damages . . . . .	176
6.8.1.10	Prejudgment Interest. . . . .	176
6.8.2	Minimum Statutory Damages Awards Under the Federal Act. . . . .	176
6.8.2.1	\$10,000 Minimum Damages. . . . .	176
6.8.2.2	Prerequisites for Minimum Damage Award . . . . .	177
6.8.2.3	Statutory Damages Awarded Against Each of Multiple Defendants . . . . .	177
6.8.2.4	Each Transferee of a Vehicle Can Obtain Statutory Damages . . . . .	177
6.8.2.5	Multiple Statutory Damages Awards to One Plaintiff for One Defendant's Multiple Violations . . . . .	178
6.8.3	Statutory Damages Awards Under State Statutes . . . . .	178
6.8.4	Attorney Fees. . . . .	178
6.8.5	Costs . . . . .	179
6.8.6	Class Actions . . . . .	180
6.9	Government Enforcement . . . . .	180
6.9.1	Federal Enforcement . . . . .	180
6.9.1.1	Inspections, Impoundments, and Investigations. . . . .	180
6.9.1.2	Civil Penalties Sought by the United States Department of Transportation. . . . .	180
6.9.1.3	Federal Criminal Penalties . . . . .	181

6.9.1.4 Injunctive Relief Sought by United States Attorney General . . . .	181
6.9.2 State Attorney General Enforcement of the Federal Act . . . . .	182
6.9.3 State Attorney General Enforcement of State Act . . . . .	182

Chapter 7

Other Statutes Specifically Relating to Automobile Fraud

7.1 Introduction; Enforcement of State Automobile Fraud Statutes . . . . .	183
7.2 Statutes Dealing with Disclosure of Vehicle’s Prior Physical Damage . . . . .	184
7.2.1 State Salvage Vehicle Statutes . . . . .	184
7.2.1.1 Introduction . . . . .	184
7.2.1.2 Constitutionality . . . . .	184
7.2.1.3 Persons Covered . . . . .	184
7.2.1.4 Definition of Salvage Vehicle . . . . .	185
7.2.1.5 Requirement That Title Be Exchanged for Salvage Certificate . . . . .	186
7.2.1.6 Titling, Resale, and Disclosure . . . . .	186
7.2.1.7 Buyer’s Waiver of Statutory Protections . . . . .	188
7.2.1.8 State Vehicle Identification Number Laws . . . . .	188
7.2.1.9 Interstate Transfers of Salvage Vehicles . . . . .	189
7.2.1.10 Remedies . . . . .	189
7.2.2 Used Car Damage Disclosure Statutes . . . . .	191
7.2.2.1 Overview . . . . .	191
7.2.2.2 Requirements and Interpretations . . . . .	191
7.2.2.3 Remedies for Violations of Used Car Damage Disclosure Statutes . . . . .	194
7.2.2.4 Used Vehicles Such As Demonstrator Vehicles Covered by New Car Damage Disclosure Laws . . . . .	194
7.2.3 New Car Damage Disclosure Statutes . . . . .	195
7.2.3.1 Practices Covered . . . . .	195
7.2.3.2 Threshold Amounts of Damage Requiring Disclosure . . . . .	195
7.2.3.3 Type of Damage That Must Be Disclosed . . . . .	196
7.2.3.4 Timing of Disclosure Requirement . . . . .	196
7.2.3.5 Actual Knowledge Precondition . . . . .	196
7.2.3.6 Remedies . . . . .	197
7.2.3.7 Statutes Shield Dealers from Consumer Remedies When Threshold Damage Amount Is Not Reached . . . . .	197
7.2.4 Special Requirements for Water-Damaged Vehicles . . . . .	198
7.2.5 Dealer Responsibility to Inspect Vehicles . . . . .	198
7.3 Statutes Dealing with Disclosure of Vehicle’s Prior Use . . . . .	199
7.4 State Laws Requiring Disclosure of Gray Market Origin . . . . .	201
7.5 State Airbag Laws . . . . .	202
7.6 State Lemon Laundering Statutes . . . . .	203
7.6.1 General . . . . .	203
7.6.2 Application to “Goodwill” and Other “Voluntary” Buybacks . . . . .	203
7.6.3 Must the Manufacturer Be the Entity Buying Back the Vehicle? . . . . .	204
7.6.4 Lack of Privity Should Not Be a Defense to a Lemon Laundering Claim . . . . .	204
7.6.5 Application of Lemon Laundering Statutes to Multistate Transactions . . . . .	204
7.6.6 Remedies for Violations of Lemon Laundering Laws . . . . .	205
7.7 Dealer Licensing Statutes . . . . .	206
7.7.1 Relevance of Dealer Licensing Statutes to Consumer Claims . . . . .	206
7.7.2 Liberal Interpretation of Licensing Statutes and Regulations . . . . .	206

7.7.3	Scope . . . . .	206
7.7.4	Compliance with State Title Laws . . . . .	207
7.7.5	Performance of Sales Contracts, Violations of Odometer Laws, and Fraud . . . . .	207
7.7.6	Recordkeeping Requirements . . . . .	208
7.8	Statutes Regulating Automobile Auctions . . . . .	208
7.8.1	Recordkeeping Requirements . . . . .	208
7.8.2	Disclosure and Title-Branding Requirements . . . . .	209
7.8.3	Other Requirements . . . . .	209
7.8.4	Private Remedies . . . . .	209
7.9	Special Statutory Causes of Action for Automobile Fraud . . . . .	209

Chapter 8

Common Law Fraud, Deceit, and Misrepresentation

8.1	Advantages and Disadvantages . . . . .	215
8.2	Basic Elements of a Fraud Action . . . . .	216
8.3	Material Misrepresentations . . . . .	216
8.3.1	Representation Must Have Been Misleading . . . . .	216
8.3.2	Representation Must Have Been Material . . . . .	217
8.3.3	Fraud by Affirmative Statements . . . . .	217
8.3.3.1	General; What Is a Statement . . . . .	217
8.3.3.2	Fact Versus Opinion; Promissory Fraud . . . . .	218
8.3.3.3	Examples of Actionable Statements . . . . .	219
8.3.4	Fraud by Active Concealment . . . . .	220
8.3.5	Fraud by Silence (Nondisclosure) . . . . .	220
8.3.5.1	General . . . . .	220
8.3.5.2	Half-Truths . . . . .	221
8.3.5.3	Seller's Superior Knowledge . . . . .	222
8.3.5.4	Statutory Duty to Disclose . . . . .	225
8.3.6	Automobile Fraud Precedent Listed by Type of Misrepresentation . . . . .	226
8.4	<i>Scienter</i> —the Seller's Knowledge That the Representation Is Misleading . . . . .	230
8.4.1	General . . . . .	230
8.4.2	Whose Knowledge? . . . . .	230
8.4.3	Degree of Knowledge . . . . .	231
8.4.3.1	General . . . . .	231
8.4.3.2	Actual Knowledge . . . . .	231
8.4.3.3	Recklessness . . . . .	232
8.4.3.4	Duty to Inspect As Aid to Finding of Recklessness . . . . .	233
8.4.3.5	Negligent Misrepresentation . . . . .	235
8.4.3.6	Innocent Misrepresentation . . . . .	237
8.5	Intent to Induce . . . . .	238
8.5.1	General . . . . .	238
8.5.2	Remote Sellers and Others Not in Privity with Buyer . . . . .	238
8.6	Justifiable Reliance . . . . .	240
8.6.1	General . . . . .	240
8.6.2	Proving Reliance . . . . .	240
8.6.3	When Is Reliance Justifiable? . . . . .	241
8.6.4	Puffery . . . . .	243
8.7	Proof of the Fraud Claim . . . . .	244
8.7.1	Standard of Proof: Clear and Convincing Evidence Versus Preponderance of Evidence . . . . .	244
8.7.2	Parol Evidence Rule . . . . .	245
8.8	Defenses . . . . .	245

8.8.1	Effect of Merger Clause or Disclaimer of Oral Representations . . . . .	245
8.8.2	Effect of “As Is” Clause . . . . .	247
8.8.3	Disclosure of the Existence or Possibility of Defects or Repairs . . . . .	249
8.8.4	Custom of Trade . . . . .	249
8.8.5	Preemption by Other Statutes and Election of Remedies . . . . .	250
8.8.6	Fraud by the Consumer . . . . .	251
8.9	Actual Damages . . . . .	251
8.9.1	General . . . . .	251
8.9.2	Measure of Actual Damages: Benefit-of-the-Bargain Versus Out-of-Pocket Damages . . . . .	253
8.9.3	Causation . . . . .	253
8.9.4	Plaintiff’s Duty to Mitigate Damages . . . . .	254
8.10	Punitive or Exemplary Damages . . . . .	254
8.10.1	Availability of Punitive Damages . . . . .	254
8.10.2	Actual Damages As Precondition to Punitive Damages . . . . .	255
8.10.3	Are Punitive Damages Available When the Plaintiff Seeks Rescission? . . . . .	256
8.10.4	State Criteria for Award of Punitive Damages . . . . .	257
8.10.5	Liability of Principals for Punitive Damages Due to the Conduct of Their Agents . . . . .	259
8.10.6	State Statute May Limit Size of Punitive Damages Award . . . . .	259
8.10.7	Effect of Treble Damages Provision of State Odometer Statute . . . . .	264
8.10.8	Examples of Punitive Damages Awards in Automobile Fraud Cases . . . . .	265
8.11	Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages . . . . .	266
8.11.1	Overview of the Supreme Court’s Decisions on Substantive Limits on Punitive Damages . . . . .	266
8.11.2	Reprehensibility . . . . .	268
8.11.2.1	Factors to Determine Reprehensibility . . . . .	268
8.11.2.2	Physical Versus Economic Harm . . . . .	268
8.11.2.3	Risks to Health or Safety of Others . . . . .	268
8.11.2.4	The Vulnerability of the Plaintiff . . . . .	270
8.11.2.5	Evidence of Repetition . . . . .	270
8.11.2.5.1	Relevance of evidence of repetition . . . . .	270
8.11.2.5.2	Limits on use of evidence of repetition . . . . .	271
8.11.2.6	Intent, Malice, Trickery, or Deceit . . . . .	272
8.11.2.7	Reprehensibility When There Are Multiple Claims . . . . .	272
8.11.3	The Ratio of Punitive Damages to Compensatory Damages . . . . .	272
8.11.3.1	The Supreme Court’s Ratio Rulings . . . . .	272
8.11.3.1.1	<i>Gore, State Farm,</i> <i>and Philip Morris</i> . . . . .	272
8.11.3.1.2	<i>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</i> as interpreting maritime law . . . . .	273
8.11.3.2	Justifying a High Ratio . . . . .	274
8.11.3.3	Treatment of Emotional Distress and Other Intangible Harm . . . . .	278
8.11.3.4	Increasing the Ratio When Previous Awards Have Not Achieved Deterrence . . . . .	279
8.11.3.5	Including All Actual and Potential Harm to the Plaintiff in the Ratio . . . . .	280
8.11.3.5.1	Potential harm to the plaintiff . . . . .	280

8.11.3.5.2	What can be included in the compensatory damages award to which punitive damages are compared? . . . . .	281
8.11.3.5.3	Harm that the plaintiff suffers but that cannot be included in the compensatory award. . . . .	282
8.11.3.5.4	Treatment of multiple claims . . . . .	283
8.11.3.5.5	Using the right ratio for the right defendant. . . . .	283
8.11.4	Presenting Evidence of Other Penalties for the Specific Conduct at Issue. . . . .	284
8.11.4.1	The Supreme Court’s Description of This Guidepost. . . . .	284
8.11.4.2	Comparable Penalties in Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	285
8.11.4.2.1	Revocation of business license. . . . .	285
8.11.4.2.2	Civil penalties under UDAP statutes and FTC Act. . . . .	286
8.11.4.2.3	Statute that caps punitive damages can give defendant fair notice of potential liability . . . . .	286
8.11.4.2.4	Criminal penalties . . . . .	287
8.11.5	Presenting Evidence of Defendant’s Wealth When Appropriate . . . . .	287
8.11.6	Framing Jury Instructions . . . . .	289
8.11.7	Trial Court and Appellate Review of Punitive Damages Awards . . . . .	290
8.11.8	<i>Gore</i> Standards Do Not Limit Statutory or Multiple Damages. . . . .	290
8.11.8.1	Introduction. . . . .	290
8.11.8.2	The Supreme Court Has Upheld the Constitutionality of Statutory Damages Without Regard to Their Ratio to Actual Harm . . . . .	291
8.11.8.3	Fair Notice Is Provided by Statutory Damage Provisions . . . . .	291
8.11.8.4	Comparison of Actual Harm to Punitive Damages May Be Impossible. . . . .	292
8.11.8.5	Many Statutory and Multiple Damages Provisions Are Compensatory Rather Than Punitive in Nature. . . . .	292
8.11.8.6	Statutory Damages Are Not Decided in an “Imprecise Manner” . . . . .	292
8.12	The Rescission Remedy. . . . .	293
8.12.1	Advantages and Disadvantages . . . . .	293
8.12.2	Consumer’s Slowness in Responding, Other Conduct May Preclude Rescission. . . . .	294
8.12.3	Election of Damages Versus Rescission Remedy After Case Is Filed. . . . .	295

Chapter 9

Warranty, Mistake, UDAP, RICO, Unconscionability, Negligence, and Contract Claims

9.1	Introduction . . . . .	297
9.2	Warranty Claims . . . . .	297
9.2.1	Advantages and Disadvantages in Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	297
9.2.2	Dealer’s Breach of Warranty of Title. . . . .	298
9.2.2.1	Nature of Warranty of Title. . . . .	298
9.2.2.2	Application of Warranty of Title to Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	299
9.2.2.3	Disclaimer of Warranty of Title . . . . .	301
9.2.2.4	Remedies for Breach of Warranty of Title . . . . .	301
9.2.2.4.1	UCC remedies . . . . .	301



9.2.2.4.2	Application of Magnuson-Moss Act . . . . .	301
9.2.2.4.3	Potential defendants; bond claims . . . . .	302
9.2.2.5	Obtaining Clear Title for the Buyer . . . . .	302
9.2.2.6	Practical Tips in Warranty of Title Cases . . . . .	303
9.2.3	Express Warranties. . . . .	303
9.2.3.1	Creation and Breach of Express Warranties . . . . .	303
9.2.3.2	Express Warranties in Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	303
9.2.3.2.1	Odometer reading and statements as express warranties . . . . .	303
9.2.3.2.2	Express warranties by description . . . . .	304
9.2.3.2.3	Warranties for “certified” used cars . . . . .	305
9.2.3.2.4	Absence of title brand as express warranty . . . . .	305
9.2.3.2.5	Other express warranties on used cars . . . . .	305
9.2.3.3	Disclaimers and Parol Evidence . . . . .	306
9.2.4	Implied Warranties. . . . .	306
9.2.4.1	Creation and Breach of Implied Warranties . . . . .	306
9.2.4.2	Implied Warranties in Automobile Fraud Cases . . . . .	307
9.2.4.3	Disclaimers . . . . .	308
9.2.4.3.1	Introduction . . . . .	308
9.2.4.3.2	Magnuson-Moss restrictions on disclaimers . . . . .	308
9.2.4.3.3	State law restrictions on disclaimers . . . . .	309
9.2.4.3.4	UCC restrictions on disclaimers. . . . .	309
9.2.4.3.5	Effect of the FTC Used Car Rule . . . . .	310
9.2.4.3.6	UCC duty of good faith . . . . .	310
9.2.5	Notice of Breach . . . . .	310
9.2.6	Privity . . . . .	310
9.2.7	Revocation of Acceptance As a UCC Remedy . . . . .	311
9.2.7.1	Introduction. . . . .	311
9.2.7.2	When May a Consumer Revoke Acceptance? . . . . .	311
9.2.7.3	Consumer Options After Revocation . . . . .	311
9.2.7.4	Returning the Car to the Dealer . . . . .	312
9.2.7.5	Holding the Car for Dealer Pick-Up. . . . .	312
9.2.7.6	Consumer Sale of Car After Revocation. . . . .	312
9.2.7.6.1	The consumer’s right to sell the car . . . . .	312
9.2.7.6.2	Dealing with liens on the title . . . . .	313
9.2.7.6.3	Precautions when selling a car after revocation of acceptance . . . . .	313
9.2.7.7	Consumer’s Continued Use of the Car . . . . .	313
9.2.8	Withholding Payments As a UCC Remedy . . . . .	314
9.2.9	The Damage Remedy and Limitations on Remedies Clauses. . . . .	314
9.2.9.1	Actual and Consequential Damages . . . . .	314
9.2.9.2	Punitive Damages . . . . .	314
9.2.9.3	Statute of Limitations . . . . .	316
9.2.9.4	Limitations on Remedies Clauses. . . . .	317
9.2.10	Attorney Fees. . . . .	317
9.2.11	Application of Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act to Automobile Fraud Claims . . . . .	318
9.2.11.1	Introduction. . . . .	318
9.2.11.2	Magnuson-Moss Claims Based on Written Warranties . . . . .	318
9.2.11.3	Implied Warranty Claims Under the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act. . . . .	319

9.2.11.4	Service Contract Claims Under the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act. . . . .	319
9.2.11.5	Magnuson-Moss Remedies. . . . .	319
9.3	Mistake . . . . .	320
9.3.1	Benefits of a Claim of Mistake . . . . .	320
9.3.2	Elements of a Claim of Mistake . . . . .	320
9.4	UDAP Claims . . . . .	321
9.4.1	Advantages and Disadvantages in Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	321
9.4.1.1	Strengths and Benefits of UDAP Claims . . . . .	321
9.4.1.2	Comparison to Warranty Claims. . . . .	322
9.4.1.3	Disadvantages of UDAP Claims. . . . .	322
9.4.1.4	Combining UDAP Claims with Other Claims . . . . .	322
9.4.1.5	Misrepresentation Claim Under Federal Odometer Statute As Alternative to UDAP Claim. . . . .	322
9.4.2	Scope Issues. . . . .	323
9.4.3	Deception Standard; Unaffected by Disclaimer . . . . .	324
9.4.4	Failure to Disclose As Deceptive. . . . .	325
9.4.5	Unfairness and Unconscionability. . . . .	326
9.4.5.1	Unfairness. . . . .	326
9.4.5.2	Unconscionability . . . . .	327
9.4.6	Violation of Another Statute . . . . .	327
9.4.6.1	Introduction. . . . .	327
9.4.6.2	Precedent Finding Statutory Violations to Be Automatic UDAP Violations . . . . .	328
9.4.6.3	Arguing That a Statutory Violation Is a Per Se UDAP Violation . . . . .	329
9.4.7	Specific Standards for Vehicle Sales in UDAP Statutes and Regulations . . . . .	330
9.4.8	Application of UDAP Standards to Automobile Fraud Cases. . . . .	330
9.4.8.1	Odometer Rollbacks and Mileage Misrepresentations. . . . .	330
9.4.8.2	Salvage and Collision History . . . . .	332
9.4.8.3	Lemon Laundering and Nondisclosure of History of Mechanical Problems . . . . .	334
9.4.8.4	Nature of Prior Use. . . . .	336
9.4.8.5	Sale of Used Cars As New . . . . .	338
9.4.8.5.1	Deceptive to represent used cars as new . . . . .	338
9.4.8.5.2	Distinguishing new cars from used cars. . . . .	338
9.4.8.5.3	Investigating whether a car is new or used . . . . .	340
9.4.8.5.4	Implications of FTC Used Car Rule. . . . .	340
9.4.8.6	Misrepresentations Concerning Clear Title . . . . .	340
9.4.8.7	Gray Market Vehicle Sales . . . . .	341
9.4.9	Limitations on UDAP Litigation . . . . .	341
9.4.10	UDAP Remedies . . . . .	342
9.5	Federal RICO Claims . . . . .	343
9.5.1	Advantages and Disadvantages . . . . .	343
9.5.2	Elements of a RICO Claim . . . . .	344
9.5.3	Application to Automobile Fraud Cases . . . . .	345
9.6	State RICO and Civil Theft Claims . . . . .	347
9.6.1	Overview . . . . .	347
9.6.2	Advantages of State RICO Claims over UDAP and Federal RICO Claims . . . . .	348
9.7	Lease Unconscionability Claims . . . . .	348

9.8	Negligence . . . . .	348
9.9	Breach of Contract . . . . .	349

Chapter 10

Litigating Automobile Fraud Cases

10.1	Introduction . . . . .	351
10.2	Advising the Automobile Fraud Client . . . . .	351
	10.2.1 Need for Expert Inspection . . . . .	351
	10.2.2 Consumer Must Decide Whether to Withhold Payments and Whether to Return the Car . . . . .	351
	10.2.3 How to Return the Vehicle . . . . .	352
	10.2.4 Withholding Payments . . . . .	352
	10.2.5 Asking the Consumer to Perform Preliminary Steps . . . . .	353
	10.2.6 Placing the Attorney-Client Relationship on a Sound Footing . . . . .	353
	10.2.7 Documenting Damages . . . . .	353
10.3	Pleading and Jurisdiction . . . . .	354
	10.3.1 Selecting Claims to Plead . . . . .	354
	10.3.2 Drafting the Complaint to Preserve Consumer’s Choice of Forum . . . . .	355
	10.3.3 Federal Jurisdiction . . . . .	355
	10.3.3.1 Advantages and Disadvantages of Federal Court . . . . .	355
	10.3.3.2 Supplemental Jurisdiction over State Law Claims . . . . .	356
	10.3.3.3 Framing Misrepresentation Claims As Federal Odometer Claims . . . . .	356
	10.3.4 Personal Jurisdiction over Out-of-State Defendants . . . . .	356
	10.3.4.1 General Rules . . . . .	356
	10.3.4.2 Long-Arm Jurisdiction over Out-of-State Vehicle Sellers . . . . .	357
	10.3.4.3 Internet Sales . . . . .	359
	10.3.5 Mandatory Arbitration Clauses . . . . .	360
	10.3.5.1 Introduction . . . . .	360
	10.3.5.2 Arbitration Agreement’s Existence and Application to the Parties and the Dispute . . . . .	360
	10.3.5.3 Unconscionability or Denial of Federal Statutory Rights . . . . .	361
	10.3.5.4 Are Magnuson-Moss Act Claims Subject to Arbitration? . . . . .	362
	10.3.5.5 Federal Laws Limiting Mandatory Arbitration . . . . .	362
	10.3.5.6 Waiver of the Arbitration Requirement . . . . .	363
	10.3.5.7 Who Decides Arbitrability—the Court or the Arbitrator? . . . . .	363
	10.3.5.8 Class Arbitration . . . . .	363
	10.3.5.9 Individual Arbitration Seeking Punitive Damages . . . . .	363
10.4	Liability of Potential Defendants . . . . .	364
	10.4.1 Strategic Considerations . . . . .	364
	10.4.2 Potential Defendants . . . . .	364
	10.4.3 Ratification, Acceptance of Benefits, Civil Conspiracy, and Aiding and Abetting . . . . .	365
	10.4.3.1 Introduction . . . . .	365
	10.4.3.2 Ratification . . . . .	365
	10.4.3.3 Knowing Acceptance of Benefits of Fraud . . . . .	366
	10.4.3.4 Civil Conspiracy . . . . .	366
	10.4.3.5 Aiding and Abetting . . . . .	367
	10.4.4 Recovering from the Creditor for the Dealer’s Misconduct . . . . .	367
	10.4.5 Liability of Automobile Auctions . . . . .	368
	10.4.5.1 Liability for Its Own Acts and the Acts of an Undisclosed Principal . . . . .	368
	10.4.5.2 Liability Under Federal Odometer Act . . . . .	369

10.4.5.3	Online Auctions . . . . .	370
10.4.6	Liability of Notaries . . . . .	370
10.4.7	Joint and Several Liability . . . . .	370
10.4.7.1	Overview . . . . .	370
10.4.7.2	Concerted Action . . . . .	371
10.4.7.3	Concurring or Consecutive Individual Acts . . . . .	371
10.4.7.4	Punitive Damages When There Are Multiple Defendants . . . . .	372
10.5	Discovery . . . . .	373
10.5.1	Discovery Should Begin Before Suit Is Filed . . . . .	373
10.5.2	Items to Seek in Formal Discovery . . . . .	373
10.5.3	Pattern Evidence . . . . .	374
10.5.4	Making the Most of Available Discovery Techniques . . . . .	375
10.5.5	Preparing for Discovery Battles . . . . .	376
10.5.6	Deposing the Dealer . . . . .	377
10.5.7	The Defendant’s Deposition of the Consumer Plaintiff . . . . .	377
10.5.8	Video Recording the Deposition . . . . .	378
10.5.8.1	Right to Record the Deposition . . . . .	378
10.5.8.2	Advantages and Disadvantages of Video Recording the Deposition . . . . .	379
10.5.9	Dealing with Missing Documents . . . . .	379
10.6	Res Judicata . . . . .	379
10.6.1	Prior Collection Action . . . . .	379
10.6.2	Prior Fraud Suit or Criminal Prosecution . . . . .	379
10.7	Class Actions . . . . .	380
10.7.1	In General . . . . .	380
10.7.2	Shaping the Class Action . . . . .	381
10.7.3	Claims to Assert in Automobile Fraud Class Actions . . . . .	382
10.7.4	Naming Appropriate Defendants . . . . .	382
10.7.5	Class Pleadings . . . . .	382
10.7.6	Preventing Defendants from Settling Against Individual, Unrepresented Class Members . . . . .	383
10.8	Evidentiary Issues . . . . .	383
10.8.1	Evidence of Other Bad Acts . . . . .	383
10.8.1.1	Overview of Admissibility of Other Acts Evidence . . . . .	383
10.8.1.2	To Show Intent or Motive . . . . .	385
10.8.1.3	To Show Preparation or Plan . . . . .	386
10.8.1.4	To Show Knowledge . . . . .	386
10.8.1.5	To Show Absence of Mistake or Accident . . . . .	387
10.8.1.6	To Show Habit or Routine Practice . . . . .	387
10.8.1.7	To Support Punitive Damages Claims . . . . .	388
10.8.1.8	Acts That Are Intertwined with Main Transaction; Multiple Claims; Conspiracies . . . . .	388
10.8.1.9	Admissibility Under RICO and UDAP Statutes . . . . .	389
10.8.1.10	Impeachment . . . . .	389
10.8.1.11	Practice Tips for Admission of Other Acts Evidence . . . . .	390
10.8.2	Evidence of Other Consumer Complaints . . . . .	390
10.8.3	Evidence of Wholesaler’s or Auction Company’s Bad Reputation . . . . .	391
10.8.4	Evidence of Defendant’s Settlement or Settlement Offers in This or Other Cases . . . . .	392
10.8.5	Admissibility of Evidence of Other Defendants’ Settlements; “Empty Chair” Effect . . . . .	393
10.8.6	Parol Evidence Rule and Merger Clauses . . . . .	393

10.8.7	Witness Testimony . . . . .	393
10.8.7.1	Previous and Subsequent Owners . . . . .	393
10.8.7.2	Testimony and Statements of Adverse Parties and Persons Associated with Adverse Parties . . . . .	394
10.8.7.3	Mechanic Testimony . . . . .	394
10.8.7.4	Questioned Document Examiners . . . . .	395
10.8.7.5	Other Expert Witnesses . . . . .	397
10.8.7.6	Meeting <i>Daubert</i> Standards . . . . .	398
10.8.7.7	Witnesses Who Have Received Use Immunity for Previous Testimony . . . . .	398
10.8.7.8	Defendants’ Assertion of Fifth Amendment Privilege. . . . .	399
10.8.8	Documentary Evidence . . . . .	401
10.8.8.1	Title and Registration Documents . . . . .	401
10.8.8.2	Summary Title History Reports . . . . .	402
10.8.8.3	Records of Dealer, Manufacturer, Auction House, Repair Shop, and Other Business Entities. . . . .	402
10.8.8.4	Simplifying Admission of Documentary Evidence. . . . .	403
10.8.9	Use of Criminal Conviction to Establish Liability by Collateral Estoppel. . . . .	403
10.9	Trial of Automobile Fraud Cases . . . . .	404
10.9.1	Preparing for Jury Trial . . . . .	404
10.9.2	Motions <i>in Limine</i> . . . . .	404
10.9.3	<i>Voir Dire</i> . . . . .	405
10.9.4	Conduct of the Trial . . . . .	407
10.9.5	Use of Exhibits at Trial . . . . .	407
10.9.6	Countering Defense Arguments . . . . .	408
10.9.7	Arguing for Punitive Damages . . . . .	409
10.9.8	Helping Fraud Victims Prepare to Testify . . . . .	410
10.9.9	Opening Statements . . . . .	411
10.9.10	Order of Witnesses . . . . .	411
10.9.11	Defense Attempts to Limit Use of the Word “Lemon” . . . . .	411
10.9.12	Should the Jury Be Told That Actual Damages Will Be Trebled?. . . . .	412
10.9.13	Closing Arguments . . . . .	413
10.10	Damage Awards . . . . .	414
10.10.1	Direct Actual Damages . . . . .	414
10.10.1.1	Benefit of the Bargain Versus Out-of-Pocket Damages . . . . .	414
10.10.1.2	Proving Diminished Value of Vehicle . . . . .	415
10.10.1.3	When to Utilize Used Car Valuation Guides . . . . .	417
10.10.1.4	Introduction of Used Car Guides into Evidence . . . . .	418
10.10.2	Cancellation and Recovery of Amount Paid . . . . .	419
10.10.2.1	In General . . . . .	419
10.10.2.2	Relation to Recovery for Diminished Value . . . . .	419
10.10.2.3	Treble Damages and Restitution . . . . .	419
10.10.3	Incidental and Consequential Damages . . . . .	420
10.10.3.1	General . . . . .	420
10.10.3.2	Emotional Distress Damages . . . . .	421
10.10.4	Damages in Lease Transactions . . . . .	424
10.10.4.1	In General . . . . .	424
10.10.4.2	Damages When the Consumer Cancels the Lease . . . . .	425
10.10.4.3	Incidental and Consequential Damages . . . . .	425
10.10.5	Statutory Damages . . . . .	425
10.10.6	Punitive Damages . . . . .	425

10.11	Settlement	426
10.11.1	Settlement Negotiations	426
10.11.1.1	Negotiation Strategy	426
10.11.1.2	Settlement with Financially Shaky Defendants	427
10.11.1.3	Last-Minute Settlements	428
10.11.1.4	Seeking Partial Summary Judgment to Speed Settlement	428
10.11.1.5	Mediation	428
10.11.1.6	Dealing with Multiple Defendants and the Dealer's Insurer	429
10.11.1.7	Settlements Without Adequate Attorney Fees	430
10.11.2	Settlement Terms	430
10.11.2.1	Prompt Payment	430
10.11.2.2	Dealer's or Consumer's Subsequent Resale of Suspect Vehicle	431
10.11.2.3	Protecting the Consumer's Credit Report	431
10.11.2.4	Confidentiality Agreements	431
10.11.2.5	Other Terms and Clauses	432
10.11.2.6	Court Costs and Financing Costs	432
10.11.2.7	Protecting Against the Defendant's Bankruptcy	432
10.12	Attorney Fees in Automobile Fraud Cases	433
10.12.1	Availability of Attorney Fees	433
10.12.2	Pleading Attorney Fees and Other Initial Steps to Obtain Fees	433
10.12.3	Standards for Determining Fees	434
10.12.4	Procedure for Requesting Fees	435
10.12.5	Attorney Fees When Case Is Settled	435
10.13	Collecting the Judgment	436
10.13.1	Collecting Against the Defendant's Assets	436
10.13.1.1	Locating Dealer Bank Accounts	436
10.13.1.2	Collecting from Debts Owed to the Dealer	436
10.13.1.3	Finding Hidden Dealer Assets	436
10.13.1.3.1	Information from and payments owed by manufacturer	436
10.13.1.3.2	Dealer assets on the premises	436
10.13.1.3.3	Information from dealer's former and current employees	437
10.13.1.3.4	Information held by auction houses	437
10.13.1.3.5	Information from public agencies and lending institutions	438
10.13.1.4	Collecting Against Manufacturers	438
10.13.2	Effect of Defendant's Appeal on Collection	438
10.13.3	Reaching the Dealer's Insurance Policy	438
10.13.4	Collecting on a State-Mandated Bond	439
10.13.4.1	In General	439
10.13.4.1.1	Requirement to post a bond; construing bonding statutes	439
10.13.4.1.2	Procedure for invoking bond	439
10.13.4.2	What Claimants Does the Dealer's Bond Protect?	440
10.13.4.3	Necessity to Prove Fraud or Specific Type of Conduct	441
10.13.4.3.1	Types of misconduct covered by the bond	441

10.13.4.3.2	Whether a judgment establishes the qualifying misconduct. . . . .	442
10.13.4.4	Recovery of Different Types of Damages Under a Bond . . . . .	442
10.13.4.5	Attorney Fees Collectable Under a Bond . . . . .	443
10.13.4.6	Bond Limitations on the Size of a Recovery. . . . .	444
10.13.4.7	Surety’s Liability After a Bond Has Expired. . . . .	445
10.13.4.8	Statute of Limitations for Claims on a Bond. . . . .	446
10.13.4.9	Other Limitations on a Bond’s Applicability . . . . .	446
10.13.4.10	Recovery Against a Bond When Dealer Files Bankruptcy . . . . .	446
10.13.4.11	Tips for Recovering Against a Bond. . . . .	447
10.13.5	Consumer Recovery Funds . . . . .	447

## Appendix A

### Federal Statutes

A.1	The Motor Vehicle Information and Cost Savings Act . . . . .	449
A.1.1	Introduction . . . . .	449
A.1.2	Text of the Act . . . . .	449
A.1.3	Conversion Table . . . . .	453
A.1.3.1	15 U.S.C. Sections to 49 U.S.C. Sections. . . . .	453
A.1.3.2	49 U.S.C. Sections to 15 U.S.C. Sections. . . . .	454
A.1.4	Legislative History. . . . .	454
A.1.4.1	Introduction. . . . .	454
A.1.4.2	1972 Act . . . . .	454
A.1.4.3	1976 Amendments . . . . .	455
A.1.4.4	1986 Amendments . . . . .	455
A.1.4.5	1988 Amendment . . . . .	456
A.1.4.6	1990 Amendment . . . . .	456
A.1.4.7	1994 Recodification . . . . .	456
A.1.4.8	1996 Appropriations Bill . . . . .	456
A.1.4.9	1998 Amendments . . . . .	456
A.1.4.10	2012 Amendments . . . . .	456
A.1.4.11	2015 Amendment . . . . .	456
A.2	Driver’s Privacy Protection Act, 18 U.S.C. §§ 2721–2725. . . . .	456
A.3	National Motor Vehicle Title Information System, 49 U.S.C. §§ 30501–30505 . . . . .	458

## Appendix B

### Federal Regulations

B.1	Regulations Under the Motor Vehicle Information and Cost Savings Act (Odometer Disclosures). . . . .	461
B.1.1	Odometer Disclosure Requirements, 49 C.F.R. §§ 580.1–580.17. . . . .	461
B.1.2	Selected Excerpts from Supplementary Information to Odometer Disclosure Requirements. . . . .	467
B.1.2.1	Supplementary Information to Proposed Revisions of Odometer Disclosure Requirements, 52 Fed. Reg. 27,022 (July 17, 1987) . . . . .	467
B.1.2.2	Supplementary Information to 1988 Final Rule, 53 Fed. Reg. 29,464 (Aug. 5, 1988) (amending 49 C.F.R. Part 580) . . . . .	468
B.1.2.3	Final Regulatory Evaluation for Truth in Mileage Act (Nat’l Highway Traffic Safety Admin. (Aug. 1988)) . . . . .	473

	B.1.2.4	Supplementary Information to 1989 Final Rule, 54 Fed. Reg. 35,879 (Aug. 30, 1989) (amending 49 C.F.R. Part 580) . . . . .	478
	B.1.2.5	Supplementary Information to 1991 Final Rule, 56 Fed. Reg. 47,681 (Sept. 20, 1991) (amending 49 C.F.R. Part 580) . . . . .	481
	B.1.2.6	Supplementary Information to Interim Final Rule on Exemptions, 62 Fed. Reg. 47,763 (Sept. 11, 1997) . . . . .	482
	B.1.2.7	Supplementary Information to Final Rule on Exemptions, 63 Fed. Reg. 52,630 (Oct. 1, 1998) . . . . .	482
	B.1.3	Administrative History . . . . .	483
	B.2	Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Requirements, 49 C.F.R. §§ 565.1–565.26 . . . . .	484
	B.3	National Motor Vehicle Title Information System, 28 C.F.R. §§ 25.51–25.57 . . . . .	491
Appendix C		State Laws Relating to Automobile Fraud . . . . .	495
Appendix D		State Statutes and Regulations Relating to Yo-Yo Sales . . . . .	535
Appendix E		State-by-State Information on Requesting Title Histories . . . . .	541
Appendix F		State Automobile Dealer Licensing Offices . . . . .	549
Appendix G		Sample Pleadings Available Online	
	G.1	Sample Complaints . . . . .	555
	G.2	Sample Discovery . . . . .	555
	G.3	Sample Jury Trial Documents . . . . .	555
	G.4	Sample Motions and Briefs . . . . .	556
	G.5	Sample Class Action Pleadings for Odometer Rollback Cases . . . . .	556
	G.6	Sample Attorney Fee Documents . . . . .	557
Appendix H		Websites Related to Automobile Fraud . . . . .	559
		Index . . . . .	561