

Summary Contents

	Using the Digital Library	iii
	The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law	iv
	Contents	ix
Chapter 1	Case and Claims Selection, Other First Considerations	1
Chapter 2	Forum Selection	29
Chapter 3	Venue	59
Chapter 4	Choosing the Class Definition	65
Chapter 5	Drafting the Complaint	83
Chapter 6	Plaintiff’s Preliminary Actions to Protect the Class	91
Chapter 7	The Defendant’s Response: Preliminary Motions, Individual Settlement Offers, Counterclaims, and More	103
Chapter 8	Discovery	123
Chapter 9	Representing the Named Plaintiff at Deposition	159
Chapter 10	Class Certification	169
Chapter 11	The Class Motion and Briefs	249
Chapter 12	Appeals of Certification Rulings	261
Chapter 13	Class Notice	277
Chapter 14	Negotiations and Settlement	295

Chapter 15	The Court Settlement Approval Process	339
Chapter 16	Claims Administration and Distribution of Benefits	365
Chapter 17	The Class Action Trial	373
Chapter 18	Res Judicata and Collateral Estoppel	383
Chapter 19	Attorney Fees	391
Appendix A	Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 and Advisory Committee Notes	427
Appendix B	Federal Class Action Legislation	445
Appendix C	Survey of State Class Action Law—2019	451
Appendix D	NACA Class Action Guidelines—299 F.R.D. 160	749
Appendix E	Sample Agreements with Named Plaintiffs, Co-Counsel	777
Appendix F	Selected Class Action Websites	781
	Index	783

Contents

Using the Digital Library iii

The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law iv

Chapter 1

Case and Claims Selection, Other First Considerations

1.1	How to Use This Treatise	1
1.1.1	A Practical Guide to Litigating Class Actions	1
1.1.2	All Subscribers Have Access to the Digital Version	1
1.1.3	Subjects Covered in This Treatise	1
1.1.4	Legal Citations and Resources	2
1.1.5	Appendices, Pleadings, Primary Sources, and Practice Tools	2
1.2	The Need for Consumer Class Actions	2
1.3	Challenges of Class Action Practice	5
1.3.1	Class Action Litigation Often Requires Large Up-Front Investments	5
1.3.2	Legislation, Court Decisions, and Corporate Practices Contribute to Limiting the Opportunities for Successful Consumer Class Actions	6
1.4	Maintaining High Ethical and Practice Standards in Class Actions	6
1.5	Co-Counseling with Other Attorneys	7
1.6	Alternatives to Filing a Class Action	7
1.7	Case and Claim Evaluation	8
1.7.1	Introduction	8
1.7.2	Arbitration Clauses and Class Action Waivers	8
1.7.2.1	General	8
1.7.2.2	Are Class Actions Available in an Arbitration Proceeding?	8
1.7.2.3	Challenging the Arbitration Requirement	9
1.7.3	Res Judicata Effect of a Prior Class Action	10
1.7.4	The Effect of State Law Limitations on Federal Class Actions (<i>Shady Grove</i>)	10
1.7.5	Forum Selection and Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 (CAFA) Removal	12
1.7.6	Is the Statute of Limitations Tolloed by a Previous Class Action?	13
1.7.6.1	General	13
1.7.6.2	Does <i>American Pipe</i> Tolling Apply to Subsequent Class Actions?	13
1.7.6.3	Tolling for Individual Actions—The <i>American Pipe</i> Tolling Doctrine	15
1.7.7	Do the Claims Lend Themselves to Class Certification?	17
1.7.7.1	Class Definition and Class Certification in General	17
1.7.7.2	Avoid Claims That Require Proof of Reliance or Other Individual Issues	18
1.7.7.3	Claims That Raise Primarily Legal Questions Are Ideal for Class Treatment	18
1.7.7.4	Avoid Claims That Are Technical Violations Yet Threaten Annihilating Damages	18

1.7.7.5	Consider Whether Benefits Can Be Provided to Class Members	19
1.7.7.6	Consider Claims for Equitable Relief	19
1.7.8	Whether to Allege Multiple Claims	20
1.7.8.1	In General	20
1.7.8.2	Manageability	20
1.7.8.3	Some Risks of Omitting Claims	21
1.7.9	Competing Lawsuits	21
1.8	Selecting Parties to Name As Defendants	22
1.8.1	Importance of Investigating Potential Defendants Before Filing an Action	22
1.8.2	Techniques to Investigate Potential Defendants	22
1.8.3	Evaluating Information About Potential Defendants	24
1.9	The Class Representative	24
1.9.1	What Makes a Client a Good Class Representative?	24
1.9.2	Client’s Individual Settlement Efforts Do Not Prevent Client’s Later Service As a Class Representative	25
1.9.3	Named Plaintiff’s Standing to Sue Multiple Defendants	26
1.9.4	Is One Named Plaintiff Enough?	26
1.9.5	Counsel’s Relationship with the Class Representative	27

Chapter 2

Forum Selection

2.1	Considerations in Choosing Federal or State Court	29
2.2	Federal Question Jurisdiction	31
2.3	Ordinary Federal Diversity Jurisdiction in Class Actions Not Governed by the Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 (CAFA)	31
2.3.1	Introduction	31
2.3.2	Complete Diversity of Citizenship	32
2.3.3	Amount in Controversy	32
2.3.3.1	Not Every Class Member Must Have \$75,000 in Controversy	32
2.3.3.2	The Non-Aggregation Rule	33
2.3.3.3	The Common Fund Exception	33
2.3.3.4	General Rules of Computation	33
2.3.3.5	Punitive Damages	33
2.3.3.6	Treble or Multiple Damages	34
2.3.3.7	Attorney Fees	34
2.3.3.8	Injunctive Relief and Disgorgement	34
2.4	Federal Diversity Jurisdiction and Removal Under the Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 (CAFA)	35
2.4.1	Introduction	35
2.4.2	Prerequisites of CAFA Jurisdiction	36
2.4.2.1	Class Allegations and Effect of Denial of Class Certification	36
2.4.2.2	Class Size	37
2.4.2.3	Minimal Diversity	37
2.4.2.4	Amount in Controversy	38
2.4.2.5	Effective Date	38
2.4.3	Exceptions to CAFA Jurisdiction	39
2.4.3.1	General	39
2.4.3.2	State Defendants	39
2.4.3.3	Shareholder Derivative and Other Corporate Suits	39
2.4.3.4	Cases with a Close Nexus to the Forum State	40
2.4.3.4.1	Introduction	40

2.4.3.4.2	Citizenship of class members	40
2.4.3.4.3	Local controversy exception	42
2.4.3.4.4	Home state exception	44
2.4.3.5	When the Court Has Discretion to Decline Jurisdiction	45
2.4.4	Removal and Remand Under CAFA	46
2.4.4.1	Any Defendant May Remove a Case	46
2.4.4.2	Time Limits for Removal	47
2.4.4.3	Removal of “Mass Actions”	47
2.4.4.4	<i>Parens Patriae</i> Enforcement Suits by the State	49
2.4.4.5	Remand and Appeal of Orders Granting or Denying Remand	49
2.4.4.6	Attorney Fees and Costs for Wrongful Removal	50
2.5	Burdens of Proof for Diversity Jurisdiction	51
2.5.1	Establishing the Amount in Controversy	51
2.5.1.1	Filing in Federal Court	51
2.5.1.2	Establishing the Amount in Controversy for Removal Purposes	52
2.5.2	Removal Jurisdiction	54
2.5.3	Exceptions to CAFA Jurisdiction	55
2.6	How to Keep a Class Action in State Court	56

Chapter 3

Venue

3.1	General	59
3.2	Venue Based on the Residence of Corporate Defendants	60
3.3	Venue Based on Locus of “Substantial Events”	60
3.4	Venue Based on Personal Jurisdiction over Defendants	61
3.5	Venue with Multiple Defendants	62
3.6	Removed Actions	62
3.7	Change of Venue	62
3.8	Waiver of Venue Defenses	63

Chapter 4

Choosing the Class Definition

4.1	General	65
4.2	Defining the Class Based on Transactional Facts, the Injury Suffered, and the Relief Sought	65
4.2.1	General	65
4.2.2	May a Class Be Certified If the Proposed Definition Covers Individuals Who Have Not Been Injured by the Challenged Practice?	66
4.3	Simplicity and Limiting the Class Size	67
4.4	Time Limitations on the Class Definition	69
4.4.1	The Statute of Limitations and the Starting Date for Class Membership	69
4.4.2	Other Factors in Setting the Starting Date for Class Membership	69
4.4.3	The Ending Date and Continuing Classes	69
4.5	Geographic Limitations and Multistate Class Actions	70
4.5.1	General	70
4.5.2	Strategic and Tactical Considerations	70
4.6	Standing: Class Representative Versus Class Member Injury	71
4.7	Ascertainability and Identifiability of Class Members	72
4.7.1	Class Defined by Objective Criteria	72
4.7.2	Identifying Class Members	75
4.8	Defining the Class Using Subclasses	78
4.9	Motion to Strike Based on Class Definition	80
4.10	Amending the Class Definition After the Case Is Filed	80

Chapter 5	Drafting the Complaint	
	5.1 Introduction	83
	5.2 General Pleading Considerations	83
	5.3 Special Pleading Considerations— <i>Twombly</i> and <i>Iqbal</i>	84
	5.4 Special Pleading Considerations— <i>Spokeo</i> and Standing	85
	5.5 The Sections of the Complaint	85
	5.6 Pleading Class Prerequisites	87
	5.7 Potential Problems and Pitfalls	88
	5.7.1 Preventing and Preparing for Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 (CAFA) Removal	88
	5.7.2 Claim-Splitting	89
	5.8 Other Special Pleading Considerations	89
	5.9 Reviewing the Complaint with the Client	89
	5.10 Checklist for Complaint Completion	90
	5.11 Review the Answer to the Complaint	90
	5.12 Conclusion	90
	5.13 Quick Reference	90
Chapter 6	Plaintiff’s Preliminary Actions to Protect the Class	
	6.1 Introduction	91
	6.2 Timing and Procedure	91
	6.3 Preserving Defendant’s Records and Other Documents for Use by Plaintiff	92
	6.3.1 Importance of Preserving Documents	92
	6.3.2 Preliminary Actions to Preserve Documents and Electronically Stored Information (ESI) Before Filing	92
	6.3.3 Preliminary Actions to Preserve Documents and Electronically Stored Information (ESI) After Filing	93
	6.3.4 Specific Actions Relating to Preserving Electronically Stored Information (ESI)	94
	6.3.5 Plaintiff’s Preservation Motions and Defendant’s Motions for Protective Orders	96
	6.3.6 Arguing the Motion	96
	6.4 Preventing Improper Defense Contact	97
	6.4.1 Potential Problems with Improper Defense Contact	97
	6.4.2 Overview: Allowance and Restriction of Contact	97
	6.4.3 Defense Communication with Putative Class Members Pre-Certification	98
	6.4.4 Defense Communication with Class Members After Certification	101
Chapter 7	The Defendant’s Response: Preliminary Motions, Individual Settlement Offers, Counterclaims, and More	
	7.1 Introduction	103
	7.2 General Limits on Defendant’s Ability to Delay	103
	7.3 Attempts to Settle with or Moot the Claim of Individual Named Plaintiffs	104
	7.3.1 General	104
	7.3.2 Key Supreme Court Decisions on Offers of Judgment and Representative Actions	105
	7.3.2.1 <i>Deposit Guaranty National Bank v. Roper</i>	105
	7.3.2.2 <i>Genesis Healthcare Corp. v. Symczyk</i>	106
	7.3.2.3 <i>Campbell-Ewald v. Gomez</i>	107

7.3.3	Is the Offer Sufficient to Moot Even the Class Representative’s Individual Claim?	108
7.3.3.1	General	108
7.3.3.2	Monetary Relief	109
7.3.3.3	Declaratory/Injunctive Relief	109
7.3.3.4	Prejudgment or Postjudgment Interest	109
7.3.3.5	Attorney Fees and Costs	110
7.3.3.6	Admission of Liability	110
7.3.4	Does a Rejected Tender of Complete Individual Relief Moot a Putative Class Action?	111
7.3.5	Motion to Strike Offer of Judgment	113
7.3.6	Consequences of an Individual Offer Made After Class Certification Has Been Granted	114
7.3.7	Consequences of an Individual Offer Made After Class Certification Has Been Denied	114
7.4	Motions to Dismiss	114
7.4.1	In General	114
7.4.2	Motions to Dismiss Based on Contractual Provisions Requiring Arbitration or Prohibiting Class Adjudication	114
7.5	Defendant’s Motion to Strike or Redefine the Class	116
7.6	Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment	117
7.7	Counterclaims Against Class Members	118
7.8	Efforts to Enjoin Similar Class Actions	119

Chapter 8

Discovery

8.1	Discovery by the Class Plaintiffs	123
8.1.1	Formulating a Discovery Plan and Discovery Schedule	123
8.1.2	Incorporating Electronically Stored Information (ESI) into a Discovery Plan	125
8.1.3	Rule 26(f) Conference and Stipulations	126
8.1.4	Preservation Duties	127
8.1.4.1	General	127
8.1.4.2	Defendant’s Duty to Preserve: Litigating the Litigation Hold	128
8.1.4.3	Plaintiff’s Duty to Preserve: Avoiding Sanctions for Spoliation	128
8.1.5	Scope of Electronically Stored Information (ESI) Discovery Requests	129
8.1.6	Search Terms and Custodians	130
8.1.7	Technology Assisted Review (TAR)	131
8.1.8	Form of Production	132
8.1.9	Discovery Directed to Class Certification	133
8.1.9.1	Plaintiff’s Right to Class Discovery Prior to Certification	133
8.1.9.2	How Much Pre-Certification Discovery Is Necessary?	134
8.1.9.2.1	Can the class be certified without formal discovery?	134
8.1.9.2.2	Are the allegations of the complaint sufficient for certification?	134
8.1.9.2.3	Use of surveys to gain certification without discovery	135
8.1.9.3	Discovery Directed to Identification of Class Members	136
8.1.9.4	Discovery Directed to Proving Numerosity	140
8.1.9.5	Discovery Directed to Proving Common Issues	140

8.1.10	Personal Inspection of Defendant’s Record-Keeping System	142
8.1.11	Effective Use of Requests for Admission	142
8.1.12	Discovery from Third Parties	143
8.1.13	Freedom of Information Act and Public Disclosure Requests	146
8.2	Defendant’s Resistance to Plaintiff’s Discovery Efforts	146
8.2.1	Introduction	146
8.2.2	Efforts to Bifurcate Discovery Between “Class Issues” and “Merits Issues”	147
8.2.3	Motion to Stay Discovery Pending Resolution of the Motion to Dismiss	148
8.2.4	Protective Orders	149
8.2.4.1	Motions for Protective Orders	149
8.2.4.2	Stipulated Protective Orders and Confidentiality Agreements	150
8.2.5	Defendant’s Efforts to Limit Access to Documents	151
8.3	Compelling Discovery Responses	152
8.4	Discovery by Defendant	153
8.4.1	Discovery to Harass Class Representatives or Members	153
8.4.2	Deposition of Class Representatives	155
8.4.3	Discovery from Class Members	155
8.4.4	Discovery of Plaintiff’s Fee Agreement	156

Chapter 9

Representing the Named Plaintiff at Deposition

9.1	General	159
9.2	Preparing the Named Plaintiff	159
9.3	Explaining the Deposition Process to the Named Plaintiff	160
9.3.1	General Information on the Process	160
9.3.2	Advice on Answering Questions	161
9.3.3	When Class Counsel Objects to a Question	162
9.4	Preparation for Specific Questions	162
9.4.1	Background Questions	162
9.4.2	Named Plaintiff’s Familiarity with the Complaint	163
9.4.3	History of Legal Representation	163
9.4.4	The Named Plaintiff’s Ability to Represent the Class	163
9.4.5	Mock Deposition of the Plaintiff	164
9.5	Objecting to Improper Questions at the Deposition	165
9.5.1	General	165
9.5.2	Objections Concerning Attorney-Client Privilege	165
9.5.3	Examples of Objectionable Questions Impinging upon the Attorney-Client Privilege	166
9.5.4	Other Types of Objections	166
9.5.5	Named Plaintiff’s Financial Responsibility for Costs	166
9.5.6	Tactical Decisions	167
9.6	Using Named Plaintiff’s Deposition Testimony at Class Certification	167

Chapter 10

Class Certification

10.1	Introduction	169
10.2	Interaction of Rigorous Analysis, Burden of Proof, and Merits Consideration	170
10.3	Rule 23(a) Preconditions for All Types of Class Actions	174
10.3.1	Numerosity and Impracticability of Joinder—Rule 23(a)(1)	174
10.3.2	Commonality—Rule 23(a)(2)	176
10.3.3	Typicality—Rule 23(a)(3)	179
10.3.3.1	General	179

	10.3.3.2	Standing Issues	180
	10.3.3.2.1	General	180
	10.3.3.2.2	Article III standing of the named plaintiff	181
	10.3.3.2.3	Named plaintiff’s standing to assert different claims	182
	10.3.3.2.4	Standing to sue multiple defendants	183
	10.3.3.3	Unique Defenses	184
	10.3.3.4	Typicality and the Relief Sought by Plaintiff	184
	10.3.3.5	Options When Typicality Is Problematic.	185
10.3.4		Adequacy of Representation—Rule 23(a)(4)	185
	10.3.4.1	Introduction	185
	10.3.4.2	Adequacy of Class Counsel.	185
	10.3.4.3	Class Representative’s Interests Must Be Both Similar to and Not Antagonistic to Other Class Members’ Interests	187
	10.3.4.4	Plaintiff’s Ability to Pay Litigation Costs	192
	10.3.4.5	Plaintiff’s Credibility and Moral Character.	193
	10.3.4.6	Plaintiff’s Understanding of the Class Action Process and Claims.	194
	10.3.4.7	Plaintiff’s Lack of Control over the Litigation	196
	10.3.4.8	Substitution and Intervention of Class Representatives	196
	10.3.4.9	Subclasses	198
10.4		Rule 23(b)(1) Certification	199
	10.4.1	Introduction	199
	10.4.2	Certification Under Rule 23(b)(1)(A)	199
	10.4.3	Certification Under Rule 23(b)(1)(B)	200
10.5		Rule 23(b)(2) Certification	201
	10.5.1	Relative Advantages of Rule 23(b)(2) Versus Rule 23(b)(3) Class Actions	201
	10.5.2	General Standards for Rule 23(b)(2) Class Actions.	201
	10.5.2.1	Introduction	201
	10.5.2.2	Acting or Refusing to Act on Grounds Generally Applicable to the Class	202
	10.5.2.3	Final Injunctive Relief.	203
	10.5.2.4	Corresponding Declaratory Relief.	204
	10.5.3	Is Monetary Relief Available Under Rule 23(b)(2)?	205
	10.5.3.1	Introduction and History	205
	10.5.3.2	The Impact of <i>Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes</i>	206
	10.5.4	Innovative Uses of Rule 23(b)(2)	208
	10.5.4.1	Introduction	208
	10.5.4.2	Rule 23(b)(2) Certification with Court-Ordered Notice and Opt Out	209
	10.5.4.3	Hybrid Certification.	209
	10.5.4.4	Issue Certification for Rule 23(b)(2) Classes	210
10.6		Rule 23(b)(3) Certification	210
	10.6.1	Text of Rule 23(b)(3).	210
	10.6.2	Superiority and Manageability.	210
	10.6.2.1	General	210
	10.6.2.2	Management Problems Dealing with Defendant’s Counterclaims	214
	10.6.2.3	Problem of Individual Recoveries Being Small	215
	10.6.2.4	When Can Damages Be Aggregated in Lieu of Calculating Actual Damages for Each Class Member?.	216

10.6.2.5	Manageability of Choice-of-Law Issues	216
10.6.2.5.1	General	216
10.6.2.5.2	Manageability when the governing law is substantially uniform among the states.	219
10.6.2.5.3	Applying the law of the state where the defendant has sufficient contacts.	220
10.6.2.5.4	Subclasses as a means of dealing with differences in law	222
10.6.2.6	Problem of Potentially Annihilating Damages Arising from the Aggregation of Small Individual Recoveries	222
10.6.3	Predominance.	223
10.6.3.1	General	223
10.6.3.2	Claims Based on Standard Forms or Uniform Contracts	228
10.6.3.3	Misrepresentation, Deception, and Fraud: The Question of Reliance.	229
10.6.3.4	When a Statute Requires Proof of Consumer Status.	235
10.6.3.5	Warranty-Type Claims.	236
10.6.3.6	Individual Questions of Injury or Damages	237
10.6.3.7	Do Affirmative Defenses Impede Certification?	241
10.7	Issue Classes Under Rule 23(c)(4)	243
10.7.1	History of Rule 23(c)(4).	243
10.7.2	Issue Classes and Rule 23(b)(3)'s Predominance and Superiority Requirements	244
10.7.2.1	Introduction	244
10.7.2.2	The View That the Cause of Action As a Whole Must Meet the Requirements of Rule 23(b)(3)	244
10.7.2.3	The View That Meeting the Requirements of Rule 23(b)(3) Must Be Met As to an Issue Suffices for Rule 23(c)(4) Certification	245
10.7.2.4	The Multiple Factors Approach.	245
10.7.2.5	Rule 23(c)(4) and 23(b)(3)'s Requirements in Other Circuits	246
10.7.3	Rule 23(b)(2) and Issue Classes.	246
10.8	Can a Class of Opt Outs Be Certified?	247

Chapter 11

The Class Motion and Briefs		
11.1	Motions for Class Certification	249
11.1.1	Timing of the Class Motion	249
11.1.2	Relationship Between the Statute of Limitations and Class Certification	249
11.1.3	Drafting the Class Motion and Brief	250
11.1.4	Class Certification Hearings	250
11.1.5	Relationship of Motions to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment to Class Certification Motion	255
11.2	Stipulation of Certification	257
11.3	Effect of Settlement Certification on Certification in Subsequent Litigation	258
11.4	Collateral Estoppel Effect of Denial of Certification.	258
11.5	Decertification and Reconsideration Motions	259

Chapter 12

Appeals of Certification Rulings		
12.1	General.	261
12.2	Interlocutory Appeals Under Rule 23(f) Generally	262

12.3	Circuit Standards for Exercising Discretionary Appellate Review	264
	Under Rule 23(f)	264
12.3.1	Introduction	264
12.3.2	First Circuit Standards	264
12.3.3	Second Circuit Standards	265
12.3.4	Third Circuit Standards	266
12.3.5	Fourth Circuit Standards	267
12.3.6	Fifth Circuit Standards	267
12.3.7	Sixth Circuit Standards	268
12.3.8	Seventh Circuit Standards	268
12.3.9	Eighth Circuit Standards	269
12.3.10	Ninth Circuit Standards	269
12.3.11	Tenth Circuit Standards	269
12.3.12	Eleventh Circuit Standards	270
12.3.13	D.C. Circuit Standards	271
12.3.14	Federal Circuit Standards	272
12.4	Appeals After Individual Settlement or Dismissal	272
12.5	Reassignment on Remand	275

Chapter 13

	Class Notice	
13.1	Types of Class Notice	277
13.1.1	Introduction	277
13.1.2	Mandatory Notice to Rule 23(b)(3) Classes—Rule 23(c)(2)(B)	277
13.1.3	Mandatory Notice of Settlement, Voluntary Dismissal, or Compromise—Rule 23(e)(1)	279
13.1.4	Combining Certification Notice with Notice of Settlement or Dismissal	280
13.1.5	Discretionary Notice of Certification to Rule 23(b)(1) and (b)(2) Classes—Rule 23(c)(2)(A)	280
13.1.6	Discretionary Notice to Protect Class Members and Fairly Conduct the Action—Rule 23(d)(1)(B)	281
13.1.7	Potential Need for Notice to Uncertified Class	281
13.2	Due Process and Notice Requirements	282
13.3	Content of Notice.	283
13.3.1	Requirements of Rule 23	283
13.3.2	Best Practices	284
13.3.3	Anticipating Common Questions	286
13.4	Form and Style	286
13.4.1	General	286
13.4.2	Claim Forms and Notice	287
13.5	The Class List	287
13.5.1	Compiling the Class List	287
13.5.2	Updating Class Members' Addresses	288
13.5.3	Envelope and Return Envelope	288
13.5.4	Selecting the Return Address	289
13.6	Methods of Notice	289
13.6.1	Introduction	289
13.6.2	Mail	289
13.6.3	Publication	290
13.6.4	Web and Email Notice	290
13.7	Costs of Notice	292
13.7.1	Plaintiff Usually Bears the Initial Cost	292
13.7.2	Shifting Costs to the Defendant	292

Chapter 14

Negotiations and Settlement

14.1	Two Guiding Principles	295
14.2	Settlement Before Certification	296
14.2.1	Individual Settlements Before Certification	296
14.2.2	Classwide Settlement Before Certification	297
14.3	Settling with Some of Several Defendants	298
14.4	Settlements When Related Class Actions Are Pending	299
14.5	Settlements When Related Legislation Is Passed	300
14.6	The Defendant's Plea of Poverty	300
14.7	Settlement Terms	301
14.7.1	General	301
14.7.2	Forms of Relief—Monetary, Injunctive, and Coupons	301
14.7.2.1	General	301
14.7.2.2	Requirement That Class Members Submit Claim Forms	301
14.7.3	Tax Considerations in Settling Class Actions	303
14.7.3.1	Introduction	303
14.7.3.2	Is the Relief Obtained Taxable?	303
14.7.3.3	Allocation Between Taxable and Non-Taxable Portions	303
14.7.3.4	Recovery of Capital	303
14.7.3.4.1	Reimbursement for overcharges	303
14.7.3.4.2	Statutory, minimum, and multiple damages	304
14.7.3.4.3	Damages emanating from physical injury	304
14.7.3.5	Forgiveness of Indebtedness	304
14.7.3.5.1	The general rule	304
14.7.3.5.2	Exception for bankruptcy	305
14.7.3.5.3	Exception for insolvency	305
14.7.3.5.4	Exception for forgiveness or cancellation of disputed debts	305
14.7.3.5.5	Form 1099-C, evidencing debt cancellation	306
14.7.4	Class Settlement Fund Versus Fixed Individual Recoveries	306
14.7.5	Prohibition on Geographic Discrimination	307
14.7.6	Distribution of Benefits	307
14.7.7	The Named Plaintiff's Individual Recovery	308
14.7.8	Administrative Aspects of Settlement	311
14.7.9	Reimbursement of the Class's Expenses	311
14.7.10	Release of Claims	312
14.7.10.1	General	312
14.7.10.2	NACA Guidelines on Class Member Releases	314
14.7.10.3	Specific Releases to Avoid	315
14.7.10.4	Releases Involving Homes	315
14.7.11	Second Right to Opt Out	316
14.7.12	Blow Provisions	316
14.7.13	Agreements Not to Represent and to Limit Use of Information	316
14.7.14	Non-Publicity Clauses	316
14.7.15	Defendants Required to Notify Government Officials Promptly	317
14.8	Coupon, Certificate, or "Scrip" Settlements	317
14.8.1	General	317
14.8.2	Likelihood That Coupons Will Be Redeemed	322
14.8.3	Value of Coupons If Redeemed	323
14.8.4	Attorney Fees in Coupon Settlements	324
14.9	<i>Cy Pres</i> Distributions and Fluid Recovery Provisions	326

14.9.1	Court Options When All or Part of a Recovery Cannot Be Paid Directly to Class Members	326
14.9.2	<i>Cy Pres</i> Provisions Should Be Standard in Most Class Action Settlements	327
14.9.3	Relationship of <i>Cy Pres</i> Recipient to the Class	329
14.9.4	Procedure for Selecting <i>Cy Pres</i> Recipients	330
14.9.5	Responsibilities of <i>Cy Pres</i> Recipients	332
14.9.6	Attorney Fees and the Value of <i>Cy Pres</i> Awards	332
14.9.7	Checklist in Seeking Approval of a Settlement with a <i>Cy Pres</i> Award	333
14.10	Negotiating Attorney Fees	333
14.10.1	Separate Negotiation of Fees	333
14.10.2	Lump Sum Offers	334
14.10.3	Method of Determining Fees	335
14.10.4	Quick Pay Provision	335
14.10.5	Fees for Post-Settlement Work	335
14.11	Checklist Regarding Administrative Aspects of the Settlement	336
14.12	Drafting the Proposed Settlement and Related Documents	336

Chapter 15

15.1	Filing the Proposed Settlement with the Court	339
15.1.1	Overview	339
15.1.2	“Preliminary Approval” of Settlement	341
15.1.3	The Notice	342
15.1.4	The Timing of Opt-Out and Objection Deadlines	342
15.2	Standards for Approval of Class Action Settlements	343
15.2.1	Introduction	343
15.2.2	First Circuit	344
15.2.3	Second Circuit	344
15.2.4	Third Circuit	344
15.2.5	Fourth Circuit	346
15.2.6	Fifth Circuit	346
15.2.7	Sixth Circuit	346
15.2.8	Seventh Circuit	346
15.2.9	Eighth Circuit	346
15.2.10	Ninth Circuit	346
15.2.11	Tenth Circuit	346
15.2.12	Eleventh Circuit	347
15.2.13	D.C. Circuit	347
15.2.14	Federal Circuit	347
15.3	The Final Approval Motion	347
15.4	The Fairness Hearing	347
15.5	Objections to Settlement	348
15.5.1	Introduction	348
15.5.2	A Settling Defendant Cannot Object Based on a Change in the Law	348
15.5.3	Non-Settling Defendants Usually Cannot Object to Settlement	349
15.5.4	Non-Class Members Usually Cannot Object to Settlement	349
15.5.5	Standing to Object	350
15.5.6	Class Counsel and Advice to Class Members of the Right to Opt Out or Object	350
15.5.7	Attorneys Not Representing the Class Can Advise Class Members About a Settlement	351
15.5.8	Restrictions on Communication Regarding Objections and Opt Outs	352

15.5.9	Basic Grounds for Objection	352
15.5.10	How and When to Object.	354
15.5.10.1	Filing the Objection.	354
15.5.10.2	Objectors and Intervention	354
15.5.10.3	Objector’s Right to Discovery.	356
15.5.11	Court Evaluation of Objections	356
15.5.12	Withdrawal of Objections	358
15.5.13	Attorney Fees for Objectors.	358
15.5.14	Appeals by Objectors.	359
15.5.14.1	When Can an Objector Appeal?	359
15.5.14.2	Standing to Appeal	359
15.5.14.3	Appeal Bonds for Objectors	360
15.5.14.4	Standard of Review on Appeal	362
15.6	Appeals by Third-Party Non-Objectors.	363

Chapter 16

Claims Administration and Distribution of Benefits

16.1	General.	365
16.2	Tasks Involved in Claims Administration	365
16.3	Settlement Websites.	366
16.4	Recording Class Members’ Responses to the Notice	366
16.5	Responding to Class Members’ Telephone Inquiries.	367
16.6	Problems with Opt Outs and Late Claims	367
16.7	The Class Fund and Distribution of Benefits.	368
16.7.1	Defendant’s Payment of the Settlement Fund	368
16.7.2	Qualified Settlement Funds	368
16.7.2.1	Introduction	368
16.7.2.2	Definition of a Qualified Settlement Fund (QSF)	368
16.7.2.3	Timing of the Deduction for the Transferor	369
16.7.2.4	Income Taxation of a Qualified Settlement Fund (QSF).	369
16.7.2.5	Reporting and Withholding Obligations of a Qualified Settlement Fund (QSF)	369
16.7.2.6	Taxation of Distributions to Claimants	369
16.7.3	Preparing the Final Class List for Distribution of Benefits	370
16.7.4	Sending Payments to Class Members	370
16.7.5	Dealing with Undeliverable Checks and Deceased Claimants	371
16.7.6	Determining the Validity and Amount of Claims; Court or Special Master Supervision of Claims Administration; Reports to the Court	371
16.7.6.1	Initial Determination of the Validity and Amount of Claims.	371
16.7.6.2	Special Master Administration of Individual Claims Process.	371
16.7.6.3	Court Supervision of Claims Process	372
16.7.6.4	Periodic and Final Reports	372

Chapter 17

The Class Action Trial

17.1	Introduction	373
17.2	Structure of the Trial	373
17.2.1	General.	373
17.2.2	Preparing for Trial As Early As Possible	373
17.2.3	Litigation Plan	373
17.2.4	Trial by Jury	374
17.2.5	Liability and Damages in One Trial.	374

17.2.6	Bifurcation of Liability and Damages	374
17.2.7	Innovative Trial Structures	375
17.3	Proof of Liability	375
17.3.1	General	375
17.3.2	Proof Through Class Representatives	375
17.3.3	Proof Through Class Members	375
17.3.4	Proof Through Defendant’s Rule 30(b)(6) Representative or High Level Executive	376
17.3.5	Proof Through Experts	376
17.4	Proof of Damages	376
17.4.1	Introduction	376
17.4.2	Standards of Proof	377
17.4.3	Classwide Proof by Use of a Formula	377
17.4.4	Classwide Proof by Calculation of an Aggregate Sum	377
17.4.5	Classwide Proof by Sampling and Extrapolation	378
17.4.6	Determination of Individual Damages	378
17.4.6.1	General	378
17.4.6.2	Individual Hearings After Resolution of Common Issues	378
17.4.6.3	Determination of Standard for Reprocessing	379
17.4.6.4	Determination Based on Defendant’s Records	379
17.5	Jury Instructions, Interrogatories, and Special Verdicts	379
17.5.1	General	379
17.5.2	Jury Instructions	379
17.5.3	Use of Special Interrogatories and Special Verdicts to the Jury	380
17.6	Trial of Individual Counterclaims Against Class Members	380

Chapter 18

Res Judicata and Collateral Estoppel

18.1	Res Judicata Effect of a Class Action Judgment	383
18.1.1	General	383
18.1.2	No Res Judicata Without Adequate Representation	383
18.1.3	No Res Judicata Without Proper Notice and Opportunity to Opt Out	385
18.1.3.1	To Bind Class Members, Notice Must Be Sufficiently Informative and Disseminated in a Reasonable Manner	385
18.1.3.2	Opting Out Avoids Res Judicata Bar	386
18.1.4	Res Judicata Bar Limited to Subsequent Assertion of the Same “Cause of Action”	386
18.1.5	Effect of Class Action Judgment Approving a Settlement on Claims Against Other Possible Defendants	388
18.1.6	Effect of a Class Action Judgment on an Individual’s Uncertified Claims That Theoretically Could Have Been Brought in a Prior Class Action	388
18.1.7	Framing the Certification Motion and Notice to Avoid Overbroad Res Judicata	389
18.2	Collateral Estoppel in the Class Action Context	389
18.2.1	General	389
18.2.2	Collateral Estoppel As to Class Members	389
18.2.3	Collateral Estoppel As to Class Defendant	390

Chapter 19

Attorney Fees

19.1	Sources of Attorney Fees in Consumer Class Actions	391
19.1.1	General	391

19.1.2	Common Fund and Common Benefit Doctrines	391
19.2	Statutory Attorney Fees	392
19.2.1	General.	392
19.2.2	Statutory Fees in Cases Resolved Without a Judgment and in Consent Decrees.	395
19.2.2.1	The <i>Buckhannon</i> Decision.	395
19.2.2.2	State Courts Do Not Uniformly Follow <i>Buckhannon</i>	396
19.3	How Courts Determine Reasonable Fees Based on Recovery of a Common Fund.	397
19.3.1	General Considerations	397
19.3.2	Choice of Law When the Court Has Diversity or Supplemental Jurisdiction.	397
19.3.3	The Two Competing Common Fund Methods: Percentage of Fund Versus Lodestar	398
19.3.4	Weight of Current Federal Authority Prefers the Percentage-of-Fund Approach	399
19.3.5	How to Compute a Percentage of the Recovery Award.	405
19.3.5.1	Establishing the Percentage.	405
19.3.5.2	Establishing the Value of the Fund	407
19.3.5.2.1	In-kind services as part of the fund.	407
19.3.5.2.2	When statutory attorney fees are added to the common fund	407
19.3.5.2.3	When coupons are part of the settlement	408
19.3.5.2.4	Cancellation of debt as part of the settlement.	408
19.3.5.2.5	Value of equitable relief	409
19.3.5.2.6	Effect of amounts not paid to class members	409
19.3.5.2.7	In computing the fund's value, should costs first be deducted?	410
19.3.5.2.8	Interest on the fund	411
19.3.6	How to Use the Lodestar Method to Compute Common Fund Recoveries.	411
19.3.6.1	Continued Importance of Lodestar Calculations for Common Fund Cases.	411
19.3.6.2	The Hourly Rate	411
19.3.6.3	Compensable Time	413
19.3.6.4	Time Records.	415
19.3.6.5	Lodestar Multipliers in Common Fund Recoveries	416
19.4	When and How to Apply for Fees	417
19.4.1	General.	417
19.4.2	Approval of Negotiated Fee and Notice to the Class.	418
19.5	Division of Fees Among Co-Counsel	420
19.5.1	General.	420
19.5.2	Disclosure of the Fee Agreement to the Court.	420
19.6	Tax Consequences of Attorney Fees	421
19.6.1	Introduction	421
19.6.2	Why the Concern?	422
19.6.3	IRS Ruling Indicates Fees Are Not Necessarily Income to Class Members in Opt-Out Classes.	423
19.6.4	Taxability of Certain Common Fund Attorney Fees	424
19.6.5	Taxability of Statutory Attorney Fees	424
19.6.5.1	General	424

	19.6.5.2 No Tax Is Owed on Fees in “Civil Rights” Cases, Including Some Consumer Claims	425
	19.6.6 Generally Minimal Tax Implications If Tax Liability Distributed on a Pro Rata Basis to the Whole Class	426
Appendix A	Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 and Advisory Committee Notes.	427
Appendix B	Federal Class Action Legislation	445
Appendix C	Survey of State Class Action Law—2019	451
Appendix D	NACA Class Action Guidelines—299 F.R.D. 160.	749
Appendix E	Sample Agreements with Named Plaintiffs, Co-Counsel Introduction	777
	E.1 Sample Retainer Agreement	777
	E.2 Named Plaintiff’s Duties to the Class	778
	E.3 Sample Co-Counsel Agreement.	779
Appendix F	Selected Class Action Websites	781
	Index	783

