

Summary Contents

	Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access	iii
	NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law	iv
	Contents	ix
Chapter 1	Introduction and First Considerations	1
Chapter 2	Scope	17
Chapter 3	Prohibited Bases for Discrimination	47
Chapter 4	Proving Credit Discrimination.	67
Chapter 5	Discrimination in Pre-Application and Application Procedures	97
Chapter 6	Discrimination in Credit Evaluation	129
Chapter 7	Redlining	155
Chapter 8	Discrimination Law Challenges to Predatory Lending and Unfair Pricing.	169
Chapter 9	Discrimination Subsequent to the Granting of Credit	183
Chapter 10	ECOA Procedural Requirements	193
Chapter 11	Litigating a Credit Discrimination Case	221
Chapter 12	Government Enforcement	275
Appendix A	Federal Credit Discrimination Statutes	287
Appendix B	Regulation B (Equal Credit Opportunity)	307

Appendix C	Official Interpretations of Regulation B	335
Appendix D	Fair Housing Act Regulations	353
Appendix E	Home Mortgage Disclosure Act and Regulation C	363
Appendix F	State Credit Discrimination Laws	407
Appendix G	Sample Pleadings	431
Appendix H	Sample Discovery	465
Appendix I	Consumer’s Guide to Credit Discrimination Laws (Appropriate for Distribution to Clients)	471
Appendix J	Bibliography of Social Science Research on Credit Discrimination Issues	475
Appendix K	Useful Credit Discrimination Weblinks	479
	Index	481

Contents

Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access	iii
--	-----

NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law	iv
---	----

Chapter 1

Introduction and First Considerations

1.1 Credit Discrimination Laws—A Powerful Answer to a Pervasive Problem	1
1.1.1 Credit Discrimination Is a Widespread Problem	1
1.1.2 Laws Against Credit Discrimination Provide Far-Reaching Remedies.	2
1.1.3 Growth in the Utilization of Credit Discrimination Laws	2
1.1.4 Effective Uses of Credit Discrimination Statutes	3
1.2 How to Use This Treatise.	4
1.2.1 Abbreviations.	4
1.2.2 Digital and Print Versions	4
1.2.3 Overview of the Chapters	5
1.2.4 Violation of the General Prohibition Against Discrimination Versus Violation of Specific ECOA Rules	5
1.2.5 This Treatise Analyzes Several Different Statutes.	5
1.2.6 Source Materials Found in This Treatise	6
1.3 The ECOA	7
1.3.1 Overview	7
1.3.2 History	7
1.3.2.1 1974 ECOA Version Targeted Sex and Marital Status Discrimination.	7
1.3.2.2 1976 Amendments Broaden ECOA's Scope	8
1.3.2.3 1985 Revision of Regulation B and Issuance of FRB Commentary	8
1.3.2.4 Women's Business Ownership Act of 1988	8
1.3.2.5 1991 Amendments.	9
1.3.2.6 1996 Amendments.	9
1.3.2.7 2003 Revision of Regulation B and Official Staff Commentary	9
1.3.2.8 CFPB Now Issues Regulation B and Its Official Interpretations	9
1.3.3 Sources of ECOA Precedent and Authority.	9
1.3.3.1 The Statute, Regulation, and Official Interpretations	9
1.3.3.2 Legislative History	10
1.3.3.3 Other Sources of Authority	10
1.3.3.4 The ECOA Should Be Liberally Construed	10
1.4 The Fair Housing Act.	11
1.4.1 Overview	11
1.4.2 History	11
1.5 The Federal Civil Rights Acts: Sections 1981 and 1982	12
1.6 The Americans with Disabilities Act	13
1.7 State Credit Discrimination Laws	13

2.3.2.1	General	35
2.3.2.2	Transactions Covered by Section 3605	35
2.3.2.2.1	Loans and other financial assistance used to buy, improve, repair, or maintain a dwelling	35
2.3.2.2.2	Home equity and other loans taking home as collateral	36
2.3.2.3	Credit Actors Covered by Section 3605	37
2.3.2.3.1	General	37
2.3.2.3.2	“Makers” of loans	37
2.3.2.3.3	Purchasers of loans	37
2.3.2.3.4	Sellers, brokers, and appraisers	38
2.3.3	Scope of Section 3604	38
2.3.3.1	Transactions Covered Under Section 3604	38
2.3.3.1.1	General	38
2.3.3.1.2	Does section 3604 apply to home equity loans?	39
2.3.3.1.3	Implications of the section 3604 versus section 3605 debate	40
2.3.3.2	Credit Actors Covered by Section 3604	40
2.3.4	Interference, Coercion, Intimidation, or Threats: Scope of Section 3617	41
2.3.5	Aggrieved Persons May Bring Actions	41
2.4	Scope of Federal Civil Rights Acts	42
2.5	Scope of State Credit Discrimination Statutes	43
2.6	Scope of State UDAP Statutes	44
2.7	Summary of Key ECOA and FHA Provisions	44

Chapter 3

	Prohibited Bases for Discrimination	
3.1	Introduction	47
3.2	When Is Discrimination Made on a Prohibited Basis?	47
3.3	Prohibited Bases Under Both the ECOA and the FHA	47
3.3.1	Race and Color	47
3.3.2	Religion, Creed, and Political Affiliation	48
3.3.3	National Origin	48
3.3.3.1	General	48
3.3.3.2	Ancestry or Country of Birth	48
3.3.3.3	English Language Ability	48
3.3.3.4	Immigration Status	49
3.3.3.4.1	Discrimination against immigrants	49
3.3.3.4.2	The ECOA standard	50
3.3.3.4.3	The Fair Housing Act standard	50
3.3.4	Sex and Sexual Orientation	51
3.3.4.1	General	51
3.3.4.2	Special ECOA Protections	51
3.3.4.3	Sexual Orientation	51
3.4	Prohibited Bases Under the ECOA But Not the FHA	52
3.4.1	Marital Status	52
3.4.2	Age	53
3.4.3	Public Assistance Status	54
3.4.4	Good Faith Exercise of Consumer Credit Protection Act or Other Legal Rights	54
3.4.4.1	General	54
3.4.4.2	Exercise of Rights Under the Federal Consumer Credit Protection Act or a Substituted State Statute	55

3.4.4.3	“Good Faith” Exercise of Rights	55
3.4.4.4	“Applicant” Must Exercise the Rights	56
3.5	Prohibited Bases Under the FHA, But Not the ECOA	56
3.5.1	Familial Status	56
3.5.2	Disability or Handicap	57
3.5.2.1	General	57
3.5.2.2	Definition of Handicap or Disability	57
3.5.2.3	Application of the Americans with Disabilities Act to Credit Transactions	57
3.5.2.4	Reasonable Accommodation	58
3.6	Prohibited Bases Under the Federal Civil Rights Acts	60
3.6.1	Race and Ethnicity	60
3.6.2	Citizenship Status	60
3.7	Other Prohibited Bases	60
3.7.1	General	60
3.7.2	Discrimination and the Digital Divide	61
3.8	ECOA Prohibited Bases Do Not Apply to Special Purpose Credit Programs	62
3.8.1	General	62
3.8.2	Qualifying As a Special Purpose Credit Program	63
3.8.3	Special Purpose Credit Programs Must Still Comply with Most ECOA Requirements	64
3.9	Injury Flowing from Discrimination Against Those Associated with Credit Applicant	64
3.9.1	The General Rule Under the ECOA	64
3.9.2	Application of ECOA Rule to Public Assistance and to the Exercise of CCPA Rights	65
3.9.3	The Associational Rule Under the Fair Housing and Civil Rights Acts	65

Chapter 4

	Proving Credit Discrimination	67
4.1	Introduction	67
4.1.1	Overview	67
4.1.2	Pleading Requirements	67
4.2	Proving Disparate Treatment	68
4.2.1	Introduction	68
4.2.2	Direct Evidence of Disparate Treatment	69
4.2.3	Circumstantial Evidence	70
4.2.3.1	The <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Burden Shifting Analysis	70
4.2.3.2	Is the <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Test Applicable in Credit Discrimination Cases?	71
4.2.3.3	The <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Standard in Predatory Lending/Reverse Redlining Cases	73
4.3	Proving Disparate Impact	74
4.3.1	The Disparate Impact Claim	74
4.3.1.1	Disparate Impact Cognizable Under Both ECOA and FHA	74
4.3.1.2	History of Disparate Impact Prior to Supreme Court Ruling	74
4.3.1.3	Advantages of the Disparate Impact Approach	76
4.3.2	Burdens of Proof	76
4.3.2.1	General	76
4.3.2.2	ECOA Burden of Proof	76
4.3.2.3	FHA Burden of Proof	77
4.3.2.4	Prima Facie Case for ECOA and FHA Claims	78
4.3.2.4.1	Introduction	78

4.3.2.4.2	Identification of a specific policy	78
4.3.2.4.3	Disparate impact on a protected group	80
4.3.2.4.4	Causation	81
4.3.2.5	Business Justification	82
4.3.2.6	Are There Alternative Practices with Less Disparate Impact?	84
4.4	Sources of Evidence	85
4.4.1	The Consumer’s Own Records	85
4.4.2	The Creditor’s Own Files	85
4.4.3	Credit Reporting Agency Files	86
4.4.4	Testers	87
4.4.5	Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) Data	88
4.4.5.1	General	88
4.4.5.2	Scope of HMDA	89
4.4.5.2.1	Covered lenders	89
4.4.5.2.2	Required data collection	90
4.4.5.3	Access to HMDA Data	90
4.4.5.4	Limitations of HMDA Data	91
4.4.5.5	HMDA Analysis	92
4.4.5.6	Policy Responses to HMDA Data	93
4.4.6	Other Sources of Mortgage Data	94
4.4.6.1	General	94
4.4.6.2	Government-Sponsored Enterprise (Freddie Mac and Fannie Mae) Data	94
4.4.7	Monitoring Data Required by the ECOA	95
4.4.8	Non-Mortgage Data	95
4.4.9	Non-Mortgage Creditors’ Self-Testing Data	96

Chapter 5

Discrimination in Pre-Application and Application Procedures

5.1	Introduction	97
5.1.1	The Special ECOA Requirements	97
5.1.2	Discussion of the Stages of a Credit Transaction in This Treatise	97
5.2	General Rule Against Discrimination	97
5.2.1	Introduction	97
5.2.2	What Is “Discrimination” Under the General Rule?	97
5.2.3	The General Rule Applies to All Aspects of a Credit Transaction	98
5.3	Discrimination in the Pre-Application Stage of a Credit Transaction	98
5.3.1	Overview	98
5.3.2	Marketing Discrimination	99
5.3.2.1	The ECOA Standard	99
5.3.2.2	The Fair Housing Act Standard	101
5.3.2.3	Other Guidance	101
5.3.2.4	Marketing Discrimination As a Force in Predatory Lending	102
5.3.2.5	How Discrimination in Marketing Happens	103
5.3.2.6	Market Segmentation and Pre-Screened Marketing	104
5.3.3	Discrimination in Treatment of Prospective Applicants	105
5.3.3.1	Steering	105
5.3.3.2	Testing	105
5.4	Application Procedures	107
5.4.1	General	107
5.4.2	Oral Applications for Credit	107
5.4.2.1	General	107

5.4.2.2	The Home Mortgage Exception	107
5.4.3	Providing Disparate Levels of Assistance in the Application Process	108
5.4.4	Requesting More Information About Applicants from Protected Groups.	108
5.5	Prohibited Requests for Information	110
5.5.1	General Considerations	110
5.5.1.1	Introduction	110
5.5.1.2	ECOA Restricts Creditor from “Requesting” Information About an “Applicant”	110
5.5.1.3	Information Legally Obtained Sometimes May Not Be Utilized by Creditor.	111
5.5.1.4	Should Regulation B Permit or Require Creditors to Request Information About Prohibited Bases?	111
5.5.2	Types of Information That Creditors Cannot Seek	112
5.5.2.1	Race, Color, Religion, and National Origin	112
5.5.2.2	Sex; Optional Use of Courtesy Titles	113
5.5.2.2.1	Inquiries about applicant’s gender	113
5.5.2.2.2	Courtesy titles.	113
5.5.2.2.3	Birth control, childbearing, or childrearing	113
5.5.2.3	Marital Status	113
5.5.2.3.1	When marital status information may be requested	113
5.5.2.3.2	Types of marital status information which may be requested	114
5.5.2.3.3	Creditors may also seek information that indirectly discloses marital status.	114
5.5.2.4	Information About Spouse or Former Spouse.	115
5.5.2.5	Public Assistance Status	116
5.5.3	Exceptions to Restrictions on Requested Information.	116
5.5.3.1	The Home Mortgage Monitoring Requirements.	116
5.5.3.2	Scope of the Home Mortgage Monitoring Requirements.	117
5.5.3.3	Information Required by Any Other Federal or State Statute or by Court Order for Monitoring Purposes.	117
5.5.3.4	Special Purpose Credit Programs	117
5.5.3.5	Self-Test Exception	118
5.6	Co-Signature of Spouse or Other Person.	118
5.6.1	General.	118
5.6.2	Individual Credit When No Joint Property Is Involved.	120
5.6.3	Reliance on Jointly Owned Property to Establish Creditworthiness.	121
5.6.4	Reliance on Community Property to Establish Creditworthiness.	122
5.6.5	Individual Credit When Jointly Owned Property Is Taken As Security	123
5.6.6	When Do Applicants Voluntarily Enter into a Joint Account?	124
5.6.7	Authorized Users	125
5.6.8	Signature of Guarantor’s Spouse.	125
5.7	Designation of Name on Account	126
5.8	Collateral, Security Deposits, Sureties, Other Forms of Creditor Protection	126
5.8.1	Discriminatory Practices	126
5.8.2	Injury Caused by Such Discrimination	127

Chapter 6

Discrimination in Credit Evaluation

6.1	Introduction	129
-----	--------------	-----

6.2	Credit Evaluation Practices That Violate the General Rule Against Discrimination	129
6.2.1	The ECOA and FHA Standards	129
6.2.2	Examples of Credit Evaluation Practices That Violate the General Rule	129
6.2.2.1	Applying Different Standards on a Prohibited Basis	129
6.2.2.2	Using Different Investigation Procedures on a Prohibited Basis	130
6.2.2.3	Appraisal Practices That Violate the General Rule Against Discrimination.	130
6.2.2.4	Failure to Combine Joint Applicant Income on the Basis of Marital Status	131
6.2.2.5	Requirements for Immediate Payment	131
6.2.2.6	Discrimination in Credit Limits	131
6.2.2.7	Denial of Credit for Exercise of Rights Under the Consumer Credit Protection Act	132
6.3	Understanding Credit Evaluation Systems	132
6.3.1	Introduction to the Three Types of Credit Evaluation Systems.	132
6.3.2	Credit Scoring Systems	132
6.3.2.1	Description of Credit Scoring	132
6.3.2.2	Regulation B Definition of Credit Scoring	133
6.3.3	Judgmental Systems.	134
6.3.4	Combination Systems	134
6.3.5	Different Requirements for Credit Scoring and Judgmental Systems.	134
6.4	Discrimination Issues Raised by Credit Scoring	135
6.4.1	Data Indicating That Minority and Other Protected Groups Are Disadvantaged by Credit Scoring	135
6.4.1.1	Studies Showing that Minorities Have Lower Credit Scores As a Group	135
6.4.1.2	Minorities Are More Likely to Be “Credit Invisible”	136
6.4.2	Factors in a Credit Scoring System May Disfavor Minorities and Other Protected Groups	137
6.4.2.1	Overview	137
6.4.2.2	Discrimination’s Legacy	137
6.4.2.3	Other Factors That May Disfavor Protected Classes	138
6.4.2.4	Industry’s Response	138
6.4.3	The Disparate Impact Analysis for Credit Scoring	139
6.4.4	Disparate Impact Litigation Challenging Credit Scoring	140
6.4.5	Discriminatory Uses of Credit Scoring	140
6.4.5.1	Overview	140
6.4.5.2	Discriminatory Score Thresholds	140
6.4.5.3	Overrides	141
6.4.5.4	“Coaching”	141
6.4.5.5	Credit Tier Markups	141
6.4.5.6	Use of Different Systems or Scoring Models for Different Populations	141
6.4.5.7	Setting Up Credit Scoring Models Differently and Manipulating Data.	142
6.4.6	Discriminatory Impact of Other Uses of Credit Scores.	142
6.4.6.1	General	142
6.4.6.2	Insurance Credit Scores.	142

6.4.6.2.1	Challenges to insurance credit scores	142
6.4.6.2.2	Studies of the disparate impact of insurance credit scores	143
6.5	Special ECOA Rules Concerning Credit Evaluation	144
6.5.1	Introduction	144
6.5.2	Income Sources	144
6.5.2.1	General	144
6.5.2.2	Appropriate Methods to Evaluate Protected Income	145
6.5.2.3	Individual Evaluation of Protected Income.	145
6.5.2.4	Income from Multiple Sources	145
6.5.2.5	Income Sources Associated with Older Applicants	145
6.5.2.6	Income Sources Historically Associated with Women Applicants	146
6.5.2.7	Income Sources Associated with Public Assistance Recipients	146
6.5.3	Spousal Credit History.	146
6.5.3.1	Background	146
6.5.3.2	Supplementing a Minimal Credit History.	147
6.5.3.3	Avoiding a Spouse’s Bad Credit History.	147
6.5.4	Telephone Listing	148
6.5.5	Likelihood of Bearing or Rearing Children.	148
6.5.6	Availability of Credit Insurance.	148
6.6	Allowable Discrimination on a Prohibited Basis.	148
6.6.1	Introduction	148
6.6.2	Age.	148
6.6.2.1	Introduction.	148
6.6.2.2	General Exceptions to the Prohibition Against Age Discrimination	149
6.6.2.3	Relationship to State Laws	149
6.6.2.4	Age Discrimination Rules Applying Only to Credit Scoring Systems.	149
6.6.2.5	Age Discrimination Rules Applying Only to Judgmental Systems	150
6.6.2.6	Combination Systems	150
6.6.3	Public Assistance Status	151
6.6.3.1	General Rule Against Evaluations Based on Public Assistance Status	151
6.6.3.2	Exception for Judgmental System.	151
6.6.4	Marital Status.	152

Chapter 7

Redlining

7.1	Introduction and History of Redlining.	155
7.2	Legal Claims Available to Challenge Redlining	155
7.2.1	The ECOA, FHA, and Federal Civil Rights Acts	155
7.2.2	Government Enforcement Actions	157
7.2.3	Other Federal and State Statutes	160
7.3	Insurance Redlining	160
7.3.1	Overview	160
7.3.2	The Impact of Insurance Redlining	161
7.3.3	Detecting Insurance Redlining	161
7.3.4	Legal Claims Available to Challenge Insurance Redlining	162
7.3.4.1	The Equal Credit Opportunity Act	162

7.3.4.2	The Fair Housing Act	163
7.3.4.2.1	The FHA applies to insurance	163
7.3.4.2.2	Preemption and the McCarran-Ferguson Act.	164
7.3.4.3	The Federal Civil Rights Acts	165
7.3.4.4	State Laws	166

Chapter 8

Discrimination Law Challenges to Predatory Lending and Unfair Pricing

8.1	Introduction	169
8.2	Advantages of a Discrimination Law Challenge	169
8.3	Discrimination Laws Reach Discriminatory Credit Terms, Not Just Credit Denials	170
8.4	Class Action Claims	171
8.5	Reverse Redlining	172
8.5.1	General	172
8.5.2	Showing That a Lender Targets a Protected Class	173
8.5.3	Unfair Credit Terms Sufficient to Show Reverse Redlining	174
8.5.4	Borrowers Should Not Need to Demonstrate Qualification for a Loan.	175
8.6	Discriminatory Credit Mark-Up Policies	175
8.6.1	The Practice Described	175
8.6.2	Private and Government Litigation of Discretionary Pricing Cases	176
8.6.3	Elements of the Discrimination Claim: Disparate Impact Versus Disparate Treatment	177
8.6.4	Identification of a Specific Policy and Causation	178
8.6.5	Statistical Proof of the Discriminatory Impact	179
8.6.6	Business Necessity and a Less Discriminatory Alternative	180
8.7	Discrimination in Pricing of Property, Services	180
8.7.1	Discrimination Laws Apply to Pricing of Property, Services	180
8.7.2	Types of Price Discrimination	180

Chapter 9

Discrimination Subsequent to the Granting of Credit

9.1	Introduction	183
9.2	Types of Discrimination Subsequent to the Granting of Credit	183
9.2.1	Loan Servicing	183
9.2.2	Compliance with Warranties, Other Post-Sale Service	183
9.2.3	Changes in Account Status	184
9.2.4	Treatment upon Default	184
9.3	Collection Against Non-Obligated Spouse Under Necessaries, Family Expense Laws	187
9.4	Credit Reporting	188
9.4.1	Credit Reporting Requirements of Regulation B	188
9.4.1.1	Introduction	188
9.4.1.2	Scope and Exemptions	188
9.4.1.3	Creditors Must Furnish Information About Joint Account Holders and Authorized User Spouses	188
9.4.1.4	Interaction with the Fair Credit Reporting Act	189
9.4.1.5	“Piggybacking”	190
9.4.2	Other Credit Reporting Issues	190
9.5	Creditor Actions Triggered by Borrower’s Increased Age or Change in Name or Marital Status	190
9.5.1	Rules Limiting Creditor Actions	190
9.5.2	Scope of the Rules Limiting Creditor Actions	191

9.5.2.1	Rules Apply Only to Open-End Accounts	191
9.5.2.2	Rules Protect Only Applicants Who Are Contractually Liable	191
9.5.3	Status of Account During Reapplication	191
9.5.4	When Creditor Can Request Updated Information from Account Holders	191
9.6	Continuing Requirement of Co-Signer on Credit Renewal	191

Chapter 10

ECOA Procedural Requirements

10.1	Introduction	193
10.2	Overview of ECOA Notice Requirements	193
10.3	Notification Requirement for Approved Applications	194
10.4	Notification Requirement If Creditor Makes a Counteroffer	194
10.4.1	Overview	194
10.4.2	Is a Counteroffer an Adverse Action?	194
10.4.3	Notice Requirements If Counteroffer Is Not an Adverse Action	195
10.4.4	Written Application Requirement	197
10.5	Notification Requirement for Adverse Actions	197
10.5.1	Adverse Actions Involving New Credit Accounts	197
10.5.2	Adverse Actions Involving Existing Accounts	198
10.5.3	Adverse Actions Involving Counteroffers	201
10.5.4	Content of Adverse Action Notices	201
10.5.4.1	General	201
10.5.4.2	The Reasons for Adverse Action	202
10.5.4.2.1	Reasons must be specific	202
10.5.4.2.2	Reasons must be accurate	203
10.5.4.2.3	Reasons that must be disclosed when a credit scoring system is used	204
10.5.4.2.4	When creditor discloses only the applicant's right to a statement of reasons	204
10.6	General Notice Requirements	205
10.6.1	Timing of Notices	205
10.6.2	Form of the Notification	205
10.6.2.1	General	205
10.6.2.2	Electronic Notifications	206
10.6.3	Who Must Receive Notice?	206
10.6.3.1	Applicants	206
10.6.3.2	Notice to Multiple Applicants	206
10.6.3.3	Is Actual Receipt Required?	207
10.7	Additional Notice Requirements for New Accounts	207
10.7.1	Application Required	207
10.7.2	Notice Requirements for Completed Applications	208
10.7.3	Notice Requirements for Incomplete Applications	209
10.7.4	Withdrawn Applications for Credit	210
10.8	Who Must Comply with Notice Requirements?	210
10.8.1	Creditors, But Not Arrangers of Credit, Are Required to Comply with Notice Provisions	210
10.8.2	Notice By Multiple Creditors	211
10.9	Exceptions to Notice Requirements	212
10.9.1	Incidental Consumer Credit	212
10.9.2	Business Credit	212
10.9.2.1	General	212

10.9.2.2	Rules for Small Business Applicants	212
10.9.2.3	Rules for Other Business Applicants	213
10.9.3	Creditor’s Inadvertent Error May Excuse Notice Violations	213
10.10	Relationship of ECOA Notices to Fair Credit Reporting Act Adverse Action Notices	213
10.11	Right to Receive Appraisal Report	215
10.12	ECOA Record Retention Requirements	216
10.12.1	Preservation of Records	216
10.12.2	Preservation of Records in Case of an Investigation, Enforcement Proceeding, or Civil Action	217
10.12.3	Retention of Prohibited Information	217
10.12.4	Transactions Exempt from Record Retention Requirements or Subject to More Limited Requirements	218
10.12.5	Inadvertent Error	218
10.13	Collection of Monitoring Information	218
10.14	Self-Testing	219

Chapter 11

Litigating a Credit Discrimination Case

11.1	Introduction	221
11.2	The Defendant—Who Is Liable?	221
11.2.1	Direct Creditor Liability	221
11.2.2	Finding Deep Pockets: Extending Liability Beyond Direct Creditors	221
11.2.2.1	General	221
11.2.2.2	Individual Liability	222
11.3	Does the Plaintiff Have Standing?	223
11.3.1	General	223
11.3.2	Do Testers, Non-Profit Organizations and Municipalities Have Standing?	226
11.3.2.1	General	226
11.3.2.2	FHA Standing for Testers	226
11.3.2.3	FHA Standing for Organizational Plaintiffs	227
11.3.3	Associational Standing	228
11.4	Class Actions	229
11.5	Selecting the Forum	232
11.5.1	Federal or State Court	232
11.5.1.1	Reasons to Choose One Forum or the Other	232
11.5.1.2	Forum Considerations	232
11.5.1.2.1	General	232
11.5.1.2.2	Removal and remand	232
11.5.1.2.3	Counterclaims and parallel actions	233
11.5.1.2.4	The <i>Rooker-Feldman</i> doctrine	234
11.5.1.2.5	Abstention	235
11.5.2	Deciding Whether to Select an Administrative Determination in FHA Cases	235
11.5.2.1	Administrative Option May Be Pursued Simultaneously with Court Action	235
11.5.2.2	Reasons to Choose Administrative or Judicial Option	236
11.5.2.3	How the Administrative Procedure Works	236
11.5.3	Mandatory Arbitration	237
11.5.3.1	Introduction	237
11.5.3.2	Federal Law Limiting Mandatory Arbitration	237

11.5.3.2.1	No arbitration of home mortgage or manufactured home loans	237
11.5.3.2.2	Limits on arbitration where credit extended to active duty military or their dependents	238
11.5.3.2.3	Congress overrides CFPB limits on mandatory arbitration.	239
11.5.3.3	No Arbitration Requirement Unless Arbitration Agreement Is Produced	239
11.5.3.4	Arbitration Agreements Are Subject to All Standard Contract Defenses	239
11.5.3.5	Unconscionability and Limits on Federal Statutory Rights.	240
11.5.3.5.1	General.	240
11.5.3.5.2	Arbitration clause cannot limit punitive damages	240
11.5.3.5.3	Limits on consumer’s recovery of attorney fees and costs; high arbitration fees	241
11.5.3.5.4	Waiver of right to class relief generally enforceable.	242
11.5.3.6	Who Decides a Challenge to the Arbitration Requirements Enforceability?	242
11.5.3.7	Classwide Arbitration	242
11.5.3.8	Recovering Punitive Damages in Arbitration	243
11.6	Selecting Causes of Action	243
11.6.1	Advantages of Various Claims	243
11.6.1.1	General.	243
11.6.1.2	Remedies, Forum, and Defenses	244
11.6.1.3	State Laws Generally Not Preempted	244
11.6.2	What Causes of Action May Be Brought in the Same Lawsuit?	245
11.7	Discovery Issues	246
11.8	Private Remedies.	246
11.8.1	Overview	246
11.8.2	Actual Damages	246
11.8.2.1	General.	246
11.8.2.2	Tangible Injury.	247
11.8.2.3	Intangible Damages	247
11.8.3	Statutory Damages Under State Statutes	248
11.8.4	Punitive Damages.	249
11.8.4.1	General.	249
11.8.4.2	Punitive Damages in FHA and Federal Civil Rights Cases.	249
11.8.4.3	ECOA and Punitive Damages	251
11.8.4.3.1	Generally	251
11.8.4.3.2	Limits on the size of ECOA punitive damage awards.	252
11.8.4.3.3	Factors in determining the size of ECOA punitive damages awards.	252
11.8.4.3.3.1	General	252
11.8.4.3.3.2	Amount of actual damages awarded.	252
11.8.4.3.3.3	Frequency and persistence of creditor’s non-compliance.	252

	11.8.4.3.3.4	Creditor’s resources	253
	11.8.4.3.3.5	Number of persons adversely affected	253
	11.8.4.3.3.6	Extent to which creditor’s non- compliance was intentional.	253
	11.8.4.3.3.7	Other relevant factors	253
11.8.5		Equitable and Declaratory Relief.	253
	11.8.5.1	Prospective Relief	253
	11.8.5.2	Restitution and Disgorgement	254
	11.8.5.3	Voiding an Individual’s Obligation Under a Note or Security Agreement	255
	11.8.5.4	Outcome-Based Injunctive Relief	256
11.8.6		Attorney Fees and Costs.	256
	11.8.6.1	General Standards	256
	11.8.6.2	When Is an Action Successful?	257
	11.8.6.3	Fees for Legal Services, Pro Bono, and <i>Pro Se</i> Attorneys.	260
	11.8.6.4	Calculating the Award	261
	11.8.6.5	Fee Applications	261
	11.8.6.6	Costs and Witness Fees	262
	11.8.6.7	Attorney Fees for Litigation of the Fee Award	262
	11.8.6.8	Tax Consequences of Attorney Fees Award.	262
	11.8.6.9	Appeals of Attorney Fees Awards	263
	11.8.6.10	Interim Fees.	263
	11.8.6.11	Apportionment of Award Among Defendants.	263
11.9		Creditor Defenses	263
	11.9.1	General	263
	11.9.2	Statute of Limitations.	263
	11.9.2.1	Affirmative Actions.	263
	11.9.2.1.1	ECOA and FHA claims	263
	11.9.2.1.1.1	General rules: two- or five-year statute of limitations	263
	11.9.2.1.1.2	When the statute begins to run	264
	11.9.2.1.1.3	Extending the time period— continuing violation	266
	11.9.2.1.1.4	Extending the time period— equitable tolling.	269
	11.9.2.1.2	Federal Civil Rights Acts claims	270
	11.9.2.1.3	State law claims	270
	11.9.2.2	Using Set-Off and Recoupment After Expiration of the Statute of Limitations	270
11.9.3		Business Justification Defense	271
11.9.4		Special ECOA Defenses.	272
	11.9.4.1	Good Faith Compliance.	272
	11.9.4.2	The Inadvertent Error Defense	272
	11.9.4.3	Creditor’s Lack of Reasonable Notice of Violation	273
	11.9.4.4	Special Defenses by FDIC and RTC.	273
11.9.5		Special Defenses to Fair Housing Act and Civil Rights Acts Claims	274

Chapter 12

Government Enforcement

12.1	Introduction.	275
12.2	Federal Agencies Responsible for ECOA Enforcement	275

12.2.1	The United States Attorney General	275
12.2.2	Consumer Financial Protection Bureau	275
12.2.3	Federal Trade Commission	275
12.2.4	The Federal Reserve Board	276
12.2.5	Other Federal Agencies	276
12.2.6	Agency Enforcement Policies and Statements	276
12.3	Fair Housing Act Enforcement	277
12.3.1	HUD Administrative Enforcement	277
12.3.2	Civil Enforcement of the FHA by the United States Attorney General	278
12.4	Enforcement Activities at the State and Local Levels	278
12.4.1	State and Local Enforcement of Federal Credit Discrimination Statutes	278
12.4.1.1	Introduction	278
12.4.1.2	Dodd-Frank Act May Authorize State ECOA Enforcement	279
12.4.1.3	State Enforcement of Credit Discrimination As Unfair, Deceptive, and Abusive	279
12.4.1.4	<i>Parens Patriae</i>	279
12.4.1.5	Action Based on Damage to the State or Locality	280
12.4.2	National Bank Preemption of State Enforcement of Credit Discrimination Law	282
12.4.2.1	Introduction	282
12.4.2.2	National Bank Act and OCC Preemption of State Credit Discrimination Statutes	282
12.4.2.3	Visitorial Powers Under the National Bank Act and State Agency Investigation and Enforcement	283
12.4.2.3.1	Introduction	283
12.4.2.3.2	Supreme Court’s <i>Clearing House</i> decision	283
12.4.2.3.3	Dodd-Frank Act codifies <i>Clearing House</i> and extends it to savings and loans	283
12.4.2.3.4	States regain visitorial powers as to national bank subsidiaries and affiliates	284
12.4.2.3.5	Implications of <i>Clearing House</i> and Dodd-Frank Act codification	284
12.4.2.3.6	The OCC’s regulations implementing the Dodd-Frank Act and the <i>Clearing House</i> decision	284
12.4.2.3.7	State investigatory authority upon referral from HUD	285
12.4.3	Examples of State and Local Enforcement	285

Appendix A	Federal Credit Discrimination Statutes	
A.1	Equal Credit Opportunity Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1691–1691f	287
A.2	Fair Housing Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601–3631	293
A.3	Civil Rights Acts, 42 U.S.C. §§ 1981, 1982, 1988	305

Appendix B	Regulation B (Equal Credit Opportunity)	307
------------	---	-----

Appendix C	Official Interpretations of Regulation B	335
------------	--	-----

Appendix D	Fair Housing Act Regulations.	353
Appendix E	Home Mortgage Disclosure Act and Regulation C	
	E.1 Home Mortgage Disclosure Act— 12 U.S.C. §§ 2801–2810	363
	E.2 Regulation C	368
	E.3 Official Interpretation of Regulation C	380
Appendix F	State Credit Discrimination Laws.	407
Appendix G	Sample Pleadings	
	G.1 Sample Complaint Alleging Denial of Home Mortgage and Discriminatory Appraisal Practices as ECOA, Fair Housing, and Civil Rights Acts Violations . . .	431
	G.2 Sample Municipal Complaint Alleging Discriminatory Mortgage Lending Practices under the Federal Fair Housing Act	433
	G.3 Sample Individual Complaint Alleging ECOA Co-Signer Violation	445
	G.4 Sample Class Action Complaint Alleging ECOA Co-Signer Violation	446
	G.5 Complaint Alleging Federal ECOA and State ECOA Notice Violations.	447
	G.6 First Amended Complaint Alleging ECOA Notice and State Fair Housing Violations.	448
	G.7 Complaint Alleging ECOA Notice Violations Against Servicer for Cancellation or Revocation of Final Loan Modification	452
	G.8 Agreed Pre-Trial Order Including Jury Instructions in ECOA Notice Case	457
	G.9 Proposed Jury Instructions in ECOA Notice Case	459
	G.10 Plaintiffs’ Proposed Jury Instructions in Fair Housing and ECOA Notice Case . . .	461
Appendix H	Sample Discovery	
	H.1 Plaintiff’s Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents in ECOA Notice Case	465
	H.2 Interrogatories for ECOA Cosigner Violation	467
	H.3 Interrogatories for ECOA “Zip Code Redlining”	467
	H.4 Plaintiffs’ Interrogatories in a Fair Housing Case	468
	H.5 Request for Production of Documents in Fair Housing Case	470
Appendix I	Consumer’s Guide to Credit Discrimination Laws (Appropriate for Distribution to Clients)	
	I.1 Introduction	471
	I.2 Equal Credit Opportunity	471
	I.3 Home Mortgages: Understanding Your Rights to Fair Lending	472
Appendix J	Bibliography of Social Science Research on Credit Discrimination Issues	475
Appendix K	Useful Credit Discrimination Weblinks	479
	Index	481

